

# GLEN EIRA CITY COUNCIL ORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING

# **TUESDAY 19 DECEMBER 2023**

# **MINUTES**

Meeting was held in the Council Chambers, Corner Hawthorn & Glen Eira Roads, Caulfield at 7.30pm

# **Present**

The Mayor, Councillor Anne-Marie Cade Councillor Margaret Esakoff Councillor Jim Magee Councillor Sam Parasol Councillor Sue Pennicuik Councillor Simone Zmood

# **INDEX**

1.	ACKNOWLEDGEMENT					
2.	APO	APOLOGIES				
3.		REMINDER TO DECLARE ANY CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN ANY ITEMS ON THE AGENDA				
4.	CON	FIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS	16			
5.	REC	EPTION AND READING OF PETITIONS AND JOINT LETTERS	16			
	Nil					
6.		ORTS BY DELEGATES APPOINTED BY COUNCIL TO VARIOUS ANISATIONS	16			
	Nil					
7.	REP	ORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND RECORDS OF ASSEMBLY	16			
	7.1	Advisory Committees	16			
	7.1.1	Advisory Committee Minutes	16			
	7.2	Records of Assembly	17			
	7.2.1	Records of Assemblies of Councillors	17			
8.	OFF	CER REPORTS (AS LISTED)	17			
	8.1	Compliance with Condition 38 of the Planning Permit for 10-16 Selwyn Street Elsternwick	17			
	8.2	Pop-Up Park Proposal and associated Statutory Temporary Road Closure Process - Orrong Crescent				
	8.3	31 Station Street Caulfield East				
	8.4	226 Hawthorn Road Caulfield North	26			
	8.5	Moorleigh Village - Fees and Charges				
	8.6	Our Priorities, Our Future final report				
	8.7	Review of Community Grants Program Guidelines 2024-2025				
	8.15 8.8	Audit & Risk Committee Minutes  Councillor Civic Support Expenses Policy				
	o.o 8.9	Councillor Gift Policy				
		Information Governance Policy				
		Workplace Technology and Information Security Policy				
		Tender 2023.105 Financial System Replacement				

	8.13 Tender 2024.28 Distribution of Glen Eira News	39
	8.14 Tender 2023.90 Supply and Delivery of Retail Products - GESAC	40
	8.16 Instrument for Appointment and Authorisation of Authorised Officers and	
	Infringement Penalties	41
	8.17 Mayoral Training and Development	42
	8.18 Consideration of a Tree at 48 Emily St, Carnegie for Inclusion in the	
	Classified Tree Register	42
9.	URGENT BUSINESS	
10.	ORDINARY BUSINESS	43
	10.1 Requests for reports from a member of Council staff	
	10.2 Right of reply	43
	10.3 Notice of Motion	43
	10.4 Councillor questions	43
	10.5 Written public questions to Council	43
11.	CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS	43
	Nil.	
12	CLOSURE OF MEETING	43



#### 1. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Mayor read the acknowledgement.

Glen Eira City Council Acknowledges the peoples of the Kulin Nation as Traditional Owners and Custodians, and pay our respect to their Elders past, present and emerging. We Acknowledge and uphold their continuing relationship to land and waterways. Council extends its respect to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples.

#### 2. APOLOGIES

#### **Apology**

Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Magee

That the apology from Cr Athanasopoulos and Cr Zhang be received and noted.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY** 

# 3. REMINDER TO DECLARE ANY CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN ANY ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

Councillors were reminded of the requirement for disclosure of conflicts of interest in relation to items listed for consideration on the Agenda, or any item that was considered at this meeting, in accordance with Section 130(2) of the *Local Government Act 2020* and Rule 60(3) of the Glen Eira City Council Governance Rules. Councillors were then invited to indicate any such conflict of interest.

Nil

#### **Procedural Motion**

Moved: Cr Cade Seconded: Cr Zmood

#### That Council:

#### That Council:

- 1) adjourns for 10 minutes, if a technical problem is encountered during the meeting, which prevents Council from livestreaming; and
- 2) If the meeting cannot be resumed within 30 minutes, the meeting will be adjourned, to be reconvened on Wednesday 20 December at 7.30pm.

#### **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

## **Change Order of Business**

Moved: Cr Cade Seconded: Cr Zmood

That Council changes the order of business to bring item 10.5 – Written Public Questions to Council forward to be heard at this stage of the meeting.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

#### 10.5 Written public questions to Council

This evening we had 58 Written Public Questions to Council of which 24 were able to be read out and responded to within the allocated timeframe. These are provided below:

# Matthew Zhang Murrumbeena

#### Question 1:

GESAC is 3.7km away from Carnegie Swim Centre (CSC). Millions have been spent on CSC. Council's 2023-24 Capital Works Program states \$31,500,000 of Council's cash will be spent on the Carnegie Memorial Swimming Pool (CMSP). Council states "CMSP has been a much-loved part of Glen Eira for more than 50 years...the current facility has reached the end of its serviceable life and urgently needs to be replaced. The transformation of the pool ... will benefit the Glen Eira community for generations to come." Is spending this much money on an environmentally sustainable pool only 3.7km away from GESAC a good use of Council's cash? Continuing to run the ELCs at the loss you state costs Council is less than 1% of 2023-24's expenditure on CSC. Why hasn't Council had this level of regard for its ELCs? Do you care more about a pool than our community's families, children and women?

#### Answer:

Council delivers over 120 different services and is custodian of \$2b of community assets. Given our resources are finite, there will always be a need to make decisions regarding relative priorities. It is not always possible to do everything that the community would like us to. Community views on our investment decisions are invited annually as part of our budget process.

# Tim Wilson Beaumaris

#### Question 2:

Following our Federal Member for Goldstein, Zoe Daniel, voting to defund \$100m of Federal infrastructure grants for our community, can Council whether these projects remain a priority for the next Federal election, and/or what projects it will seek funding for the next Federal election?

#### Answer:

Council reviews its *Priority advocacy projects* annually to ensure our advocacy program aligns with our current financial position, community priorities, and political climate. Our current *Priority advocacy projects 2023—2024* were endorsed by Council on 25 July 2023 and are publicly available on Council's website. We will develop our *Priority Advocacy Projects 2024—2025* in early to mid-2024 for Council endorsement. These will inform our advocacy during the 2025 federal election campaign.

# Tim Wilson Beaumaris

#### Question 3:

Now that it has been revealed in Parliament our Federal Member for Goldstein, Zoe Daniel, voted for \$2 billion of new coal subsidies, can Council advise whether it's funding priorities for the next Federal election will include additional measures to reduce greenhouse gas emissions?

#### Answer:

In line with *Our Climate Emergency Response Strategy 2021—2025* and our *Priority Advocacy Projects 2023—2024*, Council will continue to advocate for new measures to reach its goal of net zero Council emissions by 2025 and net zero community emissions by 2030. Our current advocacy priorities around climate action — which include seeking federal funding — are publicly available on our website after they were endorsed by Council on 25 July 2023.

# Gerald Sherry Caulfield East

#### Question 4:

The relocation of the Glasshouse venue to a new site on the Caulfield Racecourse Reserve will cause a significant depreciation of the neighbourhood amenity for the residents of Queens Avenue. This venue proposes to operate from 7.00am to 4.00am, seven days a week for 365 days of the year.

The relocation involves a main access/exit point for vehicles to be directly opposite residential homes on Queens Avenue. The impact of vehicle noise,

and particularly headlights at all hours of the night, will significantly interfere with the residents' right to experience a quiet and peaceful night-time environment.

What steps can the Council take to protect the residents right to a continued peaceful existence by removing vehicle access and exit via the Queens Avenue gates entirely or, at the very least, impose a 10.00pm curfew on traffic using the Queens Avenue gates?

#### Answer:

There is no planning based reason to restrict vehicle access to Queens Avenue which is an existing condition at Caulfield Racecourse. The proposal is to relocate the existing Glasshouse venue to a new location within the same parcel of land and importantly, the application does not propose any change to the use of the land, such as patron numbers and hours of operation. This limits Council's ability to impose restrictions on how the land is used.

# Gerald Sherry Caulfield East

#### Question 5:

The relocation of the Glasshouse venue at Caulfield Racecourse will result in a building twice the size of the existing Glasshouse operation. As well as gaming machines and a restaurant, it is proposed to widen the entertainment options with DJs and other loud music events.

The residents of Queens Avenue who live close by will have inflicted upon them an intolerable situation of noise and security problems, especially since it is proposed that this venue operate throughout the night until 4.00am. What restrictions can the Council impose on the MRC to ensure that the residents of Queens Avenue will not be subjected to intolerable levels of noise at night and into the early hours of the morning?

#### Answer:

The recommendation includes a condition for an updated Acoustic Impact report, which must detail any measures required to ensure that noise from the operation accords with applicable Environmental Protection Authority requirements, and these measures are to be shown on any plans submitted for endorsement to ensure compliance. If noise exceeds these levels, this will be enforceable.

# Tamara De Silva Caulfield East

# Question 6:

The Urbis report incorrectly claims that approvals for Caulfield Racecourse WP3 and WP4 were not reliant on the existing car parking spaces in the Guineas car park. The Council document sited below clearly states that the Guineas carpark is counted as well as temporary WP3 carpark to the east of the Guineas carpark.

https://www.gleneira.vic.gov.au/media/11308/caulfield-racecourse-incorporated-document-22-incorpdoc-june-2021-traffic-statement-referenced-in-condition-7.pdf

The use of the Guineas car park for new Glasshouse will lead to a loss of 562

car spaces, currently used for race day and other events. The Urbis report further incorrectly states that the Guineas carpark is not used on event days. Why has council officers approved this planning application when parts of the Urbis report are incorrect and directly contradicts previous traffic management approvals?

#### Answer:

The Council report for this item outlines that there will be a reduction of 273 car spaces from the Guineas car park, however, when factoring in the various approvals at the racecourse to date, there will be a net increase of 21 spaces within the entire reserve. This is because of the substantial increase in car park numbers within the Western and Eastern car parks that were part of the State Government approvals referred to as Works Packages 3 and 4.

# Tamara De Silva Caulfield East

#### Question 7:

The question as to where the 86 staff required for this new facility will park had not been addressed though I had asked it at an earlier meeting. One assumes they will be using many of the 143 car spaces planned. The venue has a capacity for 990 patrons plus 86 staff – that's a total of 1076 people. Are 143 car spaces adequate to meet the Statutory Car Parking Requirements Clause 52.06 of the Glen Eira Planning Scheme?

#### Answer:

Yes, the number of car spaces meet the rates within Clause 52.06 of the Glen Eira Planning Scheme. As the number of patrons and gaming floor area are not being increased, a planning permit is not required to reduce the car parking requirements. The number of car spaces specified in Clause 52.06 does not have a separate number of spaces required for staff.

# Jane Karslake Caulfield East

#### **Question 8:**

In relation to the Gaming venue of 31 Station Street

All 143 car parks exit on a residential street and will do so between 7.00am and 4.00am. It was raised in objections that this would negatively impact local residents.

It is stated in the report that the conditions for the proposed venue and the existing venue are equal in their location to residential homes. This is not true as there are no residential homes at street level immediately opposite the current Glasshouse venue.

What steps can be taken to mitigate the noise associated with this traffic movement and the continuous sweeping of headlights across the windows of houses opposite for the long opening hours and until 4.00 am?

#### **Answer:**

There is no planning restriction on the use of the existing Guineas car park which has an access point to Queens Avenue. As part of the proposal, this car

park will be reduced in size from 273 spaces to 143 spaces. It will be accessible from the existing Queens Avenue access and one on Normanby Road. There is no planning based reason to restrict use of the existing access point to Queens Avenue.

# Jane Karslake Caulfield East

#### Question 9:

A concern raised by objectors was the reverberation of noise from the venue across the racecourse. It is clear the venue will include live music, another significantly different aspect to the current venue. It is not clear how noise reverberation from the venue across Caulfield East, beyond Neerim and Kambrook road will be managed. Recent experiences of fireworks and other music events have provided a clear demonstration of how the racecourse amplifies and spreads noise well beyond the precinct.

There are references to noise reduction materials being used but these will be useless if doors are left open or are regularly opened by people exiting to the stadium like verandas.

What mitigations can be incorporated in the venue design and operation to mitigate this noise?

#### **Answer:**

The recommendation includes a condition for an updated Acoustic Impact report, which must detail any measures required to ensure that noise from the operation accords with applicable Environmental Protection Authority requirements, and these measures are to be shown on any plans submitted for endorsement to ensure compliance. If noise exceeds these levels, this will be enforceable.

# Robert Horwood Caulfield East

### Question 10:

At the 5th June Planning Conference meeting it was explained that the proposed Glasshouse will activate the Station St and Normanby Rd area. When we brought our home we understood that it was near the station area and racecourse activities but shielded to some extent from noise and activity by the locking of the gates on Queens Ave at 10pm. The greater traffic congestion, increased noise and activity associated with patrons using the proposed Glasshouse from 7am - 4am for 21 hours a day for seven days each week, 365 days of the year. will disturb daytime activities at our homes and our sleep if the Queens Ave gates are open from 7am - 4am. Will the council and MRC permanently close the Queens Ave gates to vehicles or alternatively lock them at 10am and if not how will council and the MRC ensure that the amenity of the residents is protected?

#### Answer:

There is no planning based reason to restrict the use of the existing access point to Queens Avenue. At present, there is no planning restriction regulating the time that the existing Guineas car park must shut, including the existing access point to Queens Avenue. As part of the proposal, this car park

will be reduced in size from 273 spaces to 143 spaces. It will be accessible from the existing Queens Avenue access and one on Normanby Road. **Simon Rapoport** Question 11: **Caulfield North** Is the Council aware that the planned project at 226 Hawthorn Road falls within a Local Centre, where the guidelines stipulate a preference for housing expansion that is less dense and intense than what is typical for neighbourhood activity centres, and that encourages a development design which gradually scales down to match the surrounding residential neighbourhoods? Answer: This information is detailed in the Council report for this item. In summary, there are no height controls for the subject land or the land directly to the south and east. The land to the north allows residential development up to three storeys and land to the west allows residential development up to two storeys. The proposal has been assessed as being an appropriate scale transition. **Simon Rapoport** Question 12: **Caulfield North** Is the council aware that the proposed development will be 4 stories and nearly 16 metres tall and be surrounded by 1 and 2 story shop top properties? Answer: Council is aware of the particulars of the proposal and the surrounding context which is detailed in the Council report for this item. **Sally Clarke** Question 13: **Caulfield North** Can Council confirm that the Level Crossing Removal Authority plan to remove all or a large portion of trees on Queens Avenue abutting racecourse reserve for their Shared User Path? What information does Council have on Shared User Path design? Answer: The Level Crossing Removal Project (LXRP) are proposing to construct a 3 metre Shared User Path (SUP) along the western roadside. This is supported by Council and is proposed to commence during January 2024. As part of the works the majority of the vegetation along the western roadside will be removed. However, Council has worked with the LXRP to ensure trees removed will be replaced 2 for 1 in line with the LXRP/GECC 2:1 replanting strategy agreement. As it is an LXRP project they will be leading engagement with the community.

We understand that this will commence in January 2024.

# Mark Jacobs Caulfield North

#### Question 14:

In relation to the proposed 4 story development at 226 Hawthorn Road Caulfield North, are Councillors aware that: (1) The Glen Eira City Hall is a designated listed historic building with the Heritage Council of Victoria? (2) That the height of the substantial commercial building opposite the City Hall on the corner of Hawthorn and Glen Eira Roads (224 Hawthorn Road) was restricted to 2 stories so as not to detract from the aspect of the City Hall and (3) There are no other buildings exceeding 2 stories in the vicinity of the proposed development.

#### Answer:

The original part of the Glen Eira Town Hall is located within a Heritage Overlay within the Glen Eira Planning Scheme. This planning control seeks to ensure that development of land which is affected by a heritage overlay conserves and enhances the heritage place. There are no planning controls for the land at 226 Hawthorn Road, that protect views or vistas towards parts of the original town hall building.

The office building opposite the town hall was constructed in approximately 1997. In the intervening time, the planning framework has changed substantially.

Council is aware that the prevailing building height surrounding 226 Hawthorn Road is one to two storeys in height.

# Lisa Reynolds Carnegie

#### Question 15:

Will there be any underground car parks as part of the new Glasshouse development at Caulfield racecourse 31 station street Caulfield East?

#### **Answer:**

The proposal to relocate the Glasshouse venue does not include an underground car park.

# Lisa Reynolds Carnegie

#### Question 16:

In regard to the agenda format, can written public questions to council be moved permanently to before item 7, as the public questions often relate to items on the agenda? If they are left to the end of the agenda councillors cannot consider public questions before deciding on the agenda item. I understand that it is often moved forward but not all the time and I feel this is an important item.

#### Answer:

The order of items in the Council Agenda is determined by the Glen Eira City Council Meeting Procedures Local Law and is designed to ensure that Councillors have sufficient time in the meeting to conduct the business of the Council i.e., the decision making.

The process to change the Local Law is a statutory process and therefore

takes significant time and resources. Council will be reviewing its Meeting Procedure Local Law in 2024 and community views will be sought as part of that process.

Councillors currently receive all questions and their proposed answers in advance of the Council meeting, so that they have the opportunity to consider the community sentiment shared through the questions before they make their decision. This occurs regardless of where public question time appears on the Agenda.

# Katerina Patras Flack Murrumbeena

#### Question 17:

My four-year old child's mental health and wellbeing is being compromised with Glen Eira's preliminary decision. She knows her kindergarten and baby sister's early learning centre may close, and she keeps asking me and my husband where she will go to kindergarten next year, as she has one year left. Is Council aware of the impact this process is having on children and that waiting until 12 December 2023 for a final decision is impacting our children's mental wellbeing? Furthermore, providing a 6 month extension will have the same negative impact on our pre-schoolers' mental health, stability and wellbeing as they will be uprooted a mere 6 months before starting prep. This does not appear well thought out by Council. Please think of the children.

#### Answer:

This question was responded to after being submitted to the 28 November OCM. The answer was also provided in the *Your Questions Answered* publication distributed to families on 30 November 2023.

# Matthew Zhang Murrumbeena

#### Question 18:

Are Council officers and Councillors aware of the monumental distress parents and families are currently in? We do not know whether to place our children on waitlists at other centres or to wait and hope that you keep the centres open. Placing our children on waitlists incurs a fee which Council has said they will not reimburse, leaving families financially disadvantaged. We have looked for places for our 4 years old and there are no quality places (either kindergarten or LDC) close to our home. We have liaised with the Family Liaison Officer and have not had any success.

Leaving the final decision until 12 December 2023 gives families only DAYS to find alternative care. This is not enough time. The stress of this decision is piling up, day after day, and the counselling offered by Council is inadequate. What should we do?

#### Answer:

Council made a decision on 12 December 2023 to close the Early Learning Centres on 28 March 2024. This is a final decision, and we are now in the process of implementation.

This date was extended from the date outlined in the preliminary decision of 21 December 2023 in response to feedback from families that more time is needed to find alternative childcare, and feedback from staff about more time

to find an alternative role.

Our Family Support Officers are available to support individual families find an alternative centre and can be contacted via <a href="mailto:earlylearning@gleneira.vic.gov.au">earlylearning@gleneira.vic.gov.au</a> Council will continue to provide early childhood services from all three centres up to the closure date of 28 March 2024 as long as there are children enrolled in those centres.

# Emiko Hunt Caulfield

#### Question 19:

Only 3 proposals were offered by Council to Councillors regarding the ELCs. These were remain status quo / close all centres within months / build a large expensive multi-centre Hub.

Imagine going to your mechanic with car problems, and the response being "You have 10 weeks to decide: status quo, crush the car, or buy a Lamborghini."

What business would ever get away with offering only 3 extreme and leading options!

Can Council explain in detail why only these 3 options were offered (i.e. why was there not an option to explore improved ways of running and funding)? Can Council explain how they deem this as responsible governance?

#### **Answer:**

A range of scenarios were investigated as part of the Childcare Strategic Service Review. Based on the results of these investigations, three options were presented to Council for consideration. Options that were not viable were not presented to Council.

We appreciate that you were seeking a different outcome however Council has now made a final decision to withdraw from providing an early education service from 29 March 2024.

# David Hunt Elsternwick

# Question 20:

The Victorian Minister for Children wrote the Council offering to work with them to find a solution, and urged the centres remain open for 2024 to enable this work to occur.

Why did Council ignore this request and offer from the Minister for Children? How does Council deem this responsible governance?

#### Answer:

Following its preliminary decision on 3 October 2023, Council did not receive any tangible offers of funding from other levels of government to help fund its childcare service. Council therefore made the decision on 12 December 2023 to close the Early Learning Centres on 28 March 2024.

# Tali Caspi CAULFIELD SOUTH

# Question 21:

Can Council admit that they did not extend the closing timeline from December 2023 to March 2024 to help families or staff. No families or staff

wanted a pithy 3 month extension.

We learned Council extended the timeline because otherwise, they were in breach of the Department of Education's requirements around closure policy. Why was the extension only 3 months, when no parents or staff asked for this limited timeframe as a review of the Council's community surveys and the parent-run survey would show?

#### **Answer:**

Council made a decision on 12 December 2023 to close the Early Learning Centres on 28 March 2024 following feedback from families who said they needed more time to find alternate care that best suits their needs, and from staff who said they needed more time to find a new role through redeployment to another role within Council or through career support.

Council has not breached any Commonwealth Government or Victorian Governments requirements.

#### **Stacey Coyne**

#### Question 22:

#### Caulfield

I have heard that if there are not enough children enrolled at the ELCs between January and March 2023, that Council may close the centres earlier, thereby displacing children who have not been able to secure childcare elsewhere. Can Council confirm if this is correct? Can Council promise that all centres will remain open until 31 March 2023?

#### Answer:

Council resolved to close the centres at the end of Term 1 2024, which is 28 March, not 31 March. Therefore, the ELCs will continue to operate until 28 March 2024.

Council will not close the centres before 28 March 2024 if there are still children enrolled and attending the services.

#### **Stacey Coyne**

#### Question 23:

#### Caulfield

Council claimed they had to undertake a GIA after community consultation. During the consultation process, there were no questions included in the parent survey, listening posts, and no active information seeking on gender impact. We were not asked about the impact on us as women specifically. Can Council please clearly explain the actual active measures they took to understand the impact on mothers and educators for the GIA report?

#### **Answer:**

Council undertook a Gender Impact Assessment to inform the final decision of Council.

The Gender Impact Assessment considered the extent to which the potential exit from the Early Learning Centre service would impact the accessibility of childcare in the local area and local jobs in the provision of childcare services. The Gender Impact Assessment utilised available census data, enrolment

information, sector data relating to childcare service provision, forecast data relating to population profile and local childcare workforce data. Impacts on women and educators were assessed from the data that was available through the consultation report and community and economic trends.

#### **Tavis Vallance**

#### Question 24:

#### Carnegie

Council completed a Gender Impact Assessment after it announced its preliminary decision to close its early learning centres, at the behest of the community.

The GIA highlighted the suburb of Carnegie as a situation that Council should continue to monitor. The statistics quoted in the assessment state that Carnegie has a ratio of only 0.47 childcare vacancies per child. Significantly less than Murrumbeena and Caulfield which are closer to 1.5.

The assessment infers that Carnegie parents can be sent to Caulfield East for a vacancy. However, the assessment concedes that Council is making assumptions about families' requirements. Council does not know if families are able to travel across multiple suburbs or if proximity to a child's future primary school is important.

Whilst a GIA was completed post-haste, it feels like it was not adequately considered in the final decision. Given the analysis provided, an obvious solution could have seen Council keep Carnegie ELC operational until future childcare places become available in time. Why was this option not considered?

#### Answer:

In response to the question about Carnegie, it is correct that Council cannot know the individual circumstances of each family and the childcare opportunities that will meet the needs of the children and parents/carers in each case. The overall data indicates that there are sufficient childcare places to offer services for each family and the Gender Impact Assessment suggests that Council may undertake some further research on local journey profile and families' related journey preferences for childcare locations.

Council's decision to close all three Early Learning Centres was based on a range of factors including the availability of childcare places spread across the municipality and the significant ongoing financial loss for Council if staying in direct service provision.

It is recorded that Cr Esakoff vacated the Chamber at 7:53pm. It is recorded that Cr Esakoff entered the Chamber at 7:56pm.

It is recorded that Cr Zmood vacated the Chamber at 7:58pm. It is recorded that Cr Zmood entered the Chamber at 8:00pm.

# 4. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS

Moved: Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Pennicuik
That the minutes of the Ordinary Co the Special Council Meeting held or	ouncil Meeting held on 28 November 2023 and n 12 December 2023 be confirmed.
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. RECEPTION AND READING OF PETITIONS AND JOINT LETTERS

Nil

6. REPORTS BY DELEGATES APPOINTED BY COUNCIL TO VARIOUS ORGANISATIONS

Nil

# 7. REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND RECORDS OF ASSEMBLY

# 7.1 Advisory Committees

7.1.1	AD'	VISORY COMMITTEE MIN	IUTES		
	Mo	ved: Cr Parasol	Seconded: Cr Zmood		
	That the minutes of the Advisory Committee meetings as shown below be received and noted and that the recommendations of these Committees be adopted.				
	1.	Glen Eira Business and l 2023;	Economy Advisory Committee Minutes 9 November		
	2.	Multicultural Advisory Co	ommittee Minutes – 13 November 2023; and		
	3.	Community Grants and A 2023.	Awards Advisory Committee - Minutes 21 November		
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY		

# 7.2 Records of Assembly

7.2.1	RECORDS OF ASSEMBLIES OF COUNCILLORS				
	Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Magee  That the Records of Assemblies as shown below be received and noted.				
	1. 14 November 2023 Asse	embly;			
	2. 21 November 2023 Asse	embly; and			
	3. 28 November 2023 Pre-r	meeting			
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY			

# 8. OFFICER REPORTS (AS LISTED)

8.1	COMPLIANCE WITH CONDITION 38 OF THE PLANNING PERMIT FOR 10-16 SELWYN STREET ELSTERNWICK			
	Moved: Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Esakoff		
		eport. dition 38 of Planning Permit GE/DP-34187/2021 has been nd discharged.		
	For the Motion: Against the Motion Abstained:	Crs Esakoff, Magee and Cade (3)  : Crs Parasol and Zmood (2)  Cr Pennicuik (1)		
		CARRIED		

8.2	POP-UP PARK PROPOSAL AND ASSOCIATED STATUTORY TEMPORARY ROAD CLOSURE PROCESS - ORRONG CRESCENT
	Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Magee
	That Council:
	Notes the community feedback received on the revised concept design for the proposed Alma Village Pop-Up Park trial;
	<ol> <li>Notes the submissions received throughout the public notice period and verbal submissions received at the Special Council Meeting on 19 September 2023; and</li> </ol>
	<ol> <li>Abandons the Genuine Traffic Diversion Experiment at Orrong Crescent and the associated Pop-up Park proposal.</li> </ol>
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.3	31 STATION STREET CAULFIELD EAST		
	Moved: Cr Magee Seconded: Cr Cade		
	That Council issues a Notice of Decision to Grant a Planning Permit to construct a building and carry out works for the purpose of a place of assembly and to use land to sell and consume liquor, for Application No. GE/DP-35745/2022, at 31 Station Street, Caulfield East in accordance with the following conditions:		
	Amended plans		
	1. Before the development starts, amended plans to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the plans will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The plans must be drawn to scale with dimensions and must be generally in accordance with the advertised plans (Identified as pages 1.00 to 1.09, 2.0 to 2.03, 3.0 to 3.03, 4.0 to 4.03, 5.0 to 5.16, 6.0 to 6.01, prepared by Atlas Architecture and dated March 2023, TP0000 to 0005, TP1100 to 1103, TP2100 to 2103. TP3001 to 3002, TP9100 to 9103, SK030 and SK040 prepared by Atlis Architecture and dated 12 August 2022, Arcadia Town Planning Report, pages 1 to 13, prepared by Arcadia and dated 7 March 2023), but further modified to show:		
	<ul> <li>(a) The gate that provides vehicle access to Queens Avenue to be constructed from an obscure material</li> <li>(b) The plans annotated that the gate that provides vehicle access to Queens Avenue is to be permanently closed between the hours 10pm and 7am.</li> </ul>		

# Changes required by management plans or specialist reports

- (c) Any changes required to the plans by the Tree Protection Management Plan in accordance with Condition 5.
- (d) Any changes required to the plans by the Waste Management Plan in accordance with Condition 11.
- (e) Any changes required to the plans by the STORM or MUSIC report in accordance with Condition 13.
- (f) Any changes required to the plans by the Acoustic report in accordance with Condition 15.

#### Traffic

- (g) Accessway in drop-off/pick-up area be dimensioned with a minimum 3m width.
- (h) The provision of a passing area at the Queens Avenue vehicle entrance of at least 6.1 metres wide by 7 metres long.
- (i) Corner splay or area at least 50 per cent clear of visual obstructions extending at least 2 metres along the frontage road from the edge of an exit lane and 2.5 metres along the exit lane from the frontage to be provided at each vehicle access point.
- (j) A swept path assessment using a B99 vehicle for the inner curve for each entrance to the car park.
- (k) Relocation of the pedestrian pathway next to the Normanby Road accessway to the western side of the accessway to reduce the likelihood of conflict with vehicles. Alternatively, another suitable layout to be designed to increase pedestrian safety.
- (I) All car parking spaces to be dimensioned in accordance with Table 2 of Clause 52.06-8.
- (m) Dimensions to be provided for blind aisle car parking spaces as per AS2890.1:2004.
- (n) Any grade changes within the car park to be notated.
- (o) Dimensions and clearances to be provided for the bike racks in accordance with Clause 52.34 (Bicycle facilities).

## Layout must not be altered

2. The layout of the uses and the development as shown on the endorsed plans, must not be altered or modified (unless the Glen Eira Planning Scheme specifies a permit is not required) without the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

#### Landscaping

- 3. The landscaping as shown on the endorsed plans must be carried out, completed and maintained to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.
- 4. The landscaping as shown the endorsed plans must be maintained, and any dead, diseased or damaged plant replaced in accordance with the landscaping plan to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

#### **Tree Protection**

- 5. Before the development starts, including any demolition and excavation, a Tree Protection Management Plan (TPMP) in respect of Tree No. 1 to 5, 11 to 17, and street trees 18 to 30 (as identified in the Preliminary Arboricultural Assessment, prepared by McLeod Trees and dated 15 March 2023) to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the TPMP will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The TPMP must show:
  - (a) The specification of tree protection zone (TPZ).
  - (b) The type, installation and maintenance of tree protection fencing.
  - (c) Vehicular or pedestrian access within a TPZ.
  - (d) Details of how the relocated tree no. 13 will be managed, including its removal, storage and re-planting.
  - (e) The protection of the canopies and trunks of the specified tree.
  - (f) Specific details of any works proposed in any TPZ and how impacts will be mitigated.
  - (g) How canopies will be managed, including pruning.
  - (h) Excavation within or near a TPZ.
  - (i) Maintenance, including mulching and watering within the TPZ.
  - (j) Schedule of Project Arborist inspections.

The TPMP must include a program to implement the proposed measures before, during and on completing construction (including demolition).

6. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed TPMP must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the written approval of the Responsible Authority.

# Operational requirements in relation to the sale and consumption of liquor

- 7. The sale and consumption of liquor can occur at any time within the areas defined by the endorsed red line plan, except for the period between 3am and 12pm on ANZAC Day.
- 8. In relation to the sale and consumption of liquor, no more than 990 patrons may be present within those parts of the premises, both indoor and outdoor as defined in the endorsed red line plan at any one time.

#### Construction Management Plan

- 9. Before the development starts, including any demolition and excavation, a Construction Management Plan (CMP) to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the CMP will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The CMP must show:
  - (a) Delivery and unloading points and expected frequency.
  - (b) Truck haulage routes, circulation spaces and queuing lanes.
  - (c) Details how traffic and safe pedestrian access will be managed. These must be in the form of a Traffic Management Plan designed by a suitably qualified traffic practitioner.
  - (d) A liaison officer for contact by owners / residents and the Responsible Authority in the event of relevant queries or problems experienced.

- (e) An outline of requests to occupy public footpaths or roads, or anticipated disruptions to local services.
- (f) Any requirements outlined within this permit as required by the relevant referral authorities.
- (g) Hours for construction activity must only occur within the following hours:
  - i. 7am to 6pm Monday to Friday
  - ii. 7am to 1pm Saturdays
  - ii. No construction on Sundays or public holidays
- (h) Measures to control noise, dust, erosion, sediment, stormwater, litter and other construction waste and any chemical contamination.
- (i) Measures to ensure that sub-contractors/tradespersons operating on the site are aware of the contents of the Construction Management Plan
- (j) Any construction lighting to be baffled to minimise intrusion on adjoining lots.
- 10. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed CMP must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the written approval of the Responsible Authority.

#### Waste Management Plan

- 11. Before the development starts, a Waste Management Plan (WMP) to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the WMP will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The WMP must generally accord with the plan identified as "Waste Management Plan", prepared by WSP and dated 24 August 2022, however, modified to show:
  - (a) Correct swept path diagram that is consistent with the proposed collection path for the waste truck.
  - (b) Incorporate fewer waste collections per week maximum of two, and consideration for compaction machines to manage expected volumes.
  - (c) Scaled drawing including storage location for proposed extended waste streams infrastructure.
  - (d) Information regarding the truck arrival times. These arrival times will need to ensure minimal impact on the car park operation and road user safety.
- 12. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed WMP must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the written approval of the Responsible Authority.

#### Environmentally Sustainable Design

13. Before the development starts, a STORM or MUSIC report to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. This report must demonstrate that the proposal meets current best practice performance objectives for stormwater quality is to be submitted. A stormwater runoff plan should be submitted with the response, to identify and separate areas based on rainwater treatment types.

14. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed Environmentally Sustainable Design Report must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the written approval of the Responsible Authority.

#### Acoustic Report

- 15. Concurrent with the endorsement of amended plans as required by Condition 1 of this permit, an amended Acoustic Report prepared by a suitably qualified acoustic engineer and to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. The report must be generally in accordance with the Acoustic Schematic Design Report, prepared by ADP Consulting and dated 2 September 2022, however modified to include the following:
  - (a) Background noise monitoring on-site during licensed operating hours for the facility to quantify the existing background noise levels, including octave band noise levels.
  - (b) A correction within the report to show all relevant street names to the subject site and any modified recommendations based on reference to correct street names.

The amended Acoustic Report must include recommendations to mitigate noise impacts from the premises to ensure compliance with Condition 17 of this permit.

- 16. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed Acoustic Report must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the written approval of the Responsible Authority.
- 17. Noise levels to and from the development must not exceed those required to be met under the *Environment Protection Regulations 2021* and EPA Publication 1826.4 noise limit and assessment protocol for the control of noise from commercial, industrial and trade premises and entertainment venues, or any other equivalent or applicable State or relevant policy and should meet accepted sleep disturbance criteria, EPA Publication 1254.2 and any other relevant guideline or Australian Standard.

#### Patron Management Plan

- 18. Before the use starts, a patron management plan must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the plan will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. All activities forming part of the approved use of the land for the sale and consumption of liquor must comply with the endorsed plan. The plan must include:
  - (a) Staffing and other measures that are designed to ensure the orderly arrival and departure of patrons.
  - (b) Signage to be used to encourage responsible off-site patron behaviour.
  - (c) The training of staff in the management of patron behaviour.
  - (d) Staff communication arrangements.
  - (e) Measures to control noise emissions from the premises.

The use must be carried out in accordance with the approved plan to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be altered or modified without the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

## Car and Bicycle Parking

- 19. Before the use starts, the areas set aside for the parking of vehicles and access lanes as shown on the endorsed plans must be:
  - (a) Fully constructed.
  - (b) Properly formed to such levels that may be used in accordance with the plans.
  - (c) Surfaced with an all-weather surface or seal coat (as appropriate).
  - (d) Drained and maintained in a continuously usable condition.
  - (e) Line marked to indicate each car space, loading bay and/or access lane.
  - (f) Clearly marked to show the direction of traffic along access lanes and driveways.

All to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

- 20. Car spaces, access lanes and driveways shown on the endorsed plans must not be used for any other purpose.
- 21. Vehicular crossings must be constructed to the road to suit the proposed driveways to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and any existing crossing or crossing opening must be removed and replaced with footpath, naturestrip and kerb and channel to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

### General requirements

- 22. All pipes, fixtures, fittings and vents servicing any building on the site must be concealed in service ducts or otherwise hidden from view to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.
- 23. No plant, equipment, services and substations other than those shown on the endorsed plans are permitted except with the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.
- 24. Any modification to existing infrastructure and services within the road reserve (including, but not limited to electricity supply, telecommunications services, gas supply, water supply, sewerage services and stormwater drainage) necessary to provide the required access to the site, must be undertaken by the permit holder to the satisfaction of the relevant authority. All expenses to undertake modification to infrastructure and services must be met by the owner of the land.
- 25. External lighting must be designed, baffled and located to prevent any adverse effect from light spill to the amenity of abutting and adjoining land to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.
- 26. This permit will expire if one of the following circumstances applies:

- (a) The development is not started within three years of the date of this permit.
- (b) The development is not completed within five years of the date of this permit.

The Responsible Authority may extend the permit if a request is made in writing in accordance with Section 69 of *Planning and Environment Act* 1987.

#### **Notes**

#### General notes

This Planning Permit represents the Planning approval for the use and/or development of the land. This Planning Permit does not represent the approval of other departments of Glen Eira City Council or other statutory authorities. Such approvals may be required and may be assessed on different criteria from that adopted for the approval of this Planning Permit. In accordance with the use rights that exist for the land, the gaming machines can only be operated between 8am and 4am on any day of the week.

#### Council's Engineering advice

- The civil design must be prepared in accordance with Council's Design Guidelines and Standard Drawings.
- All relevant Engineering Permits must be obtained before any works within the Road Reserve. All construction works within the road reserve shall be constructed according to the current Council standard drawings.
- Asset Protection Permit must be obtained from Council Engineering Services
  Department before the development starts.
- Any firefighting equipment for the building shall be accommodated within title boundary.
- Any electrical substations (to supply to the above development) shall be located within title boundary.

Department of Environment, Land, Water and Planning requirements

- The works are to be carried out generally in accordance with:
  - Works Package 6 plan and elevation set titled 'THE GLASSHOUSE'
     ISSUE A dated October 2021 prepared by Altis Architecture.
  - Application for landowner consent for use and development of Crown land titled 'MRC WORKS PACKAGE 6' received 15 November 2021 prepared by Melbourne Racing Club.
  - Further information responses received via email on 9 and 11 March 2022 and 26 April 2022 prepared by Melbourne Racing Club.
- Any modification to the works proposed will require further approval by the Program Manager Planning Approvals, Land and Built Environment Programs, Port Phillip Region, Department of Transport and Planning.
- Indigenous vegetation, other than approved by this consent, must not be damaged or removed as a result of the works.

- Any clearing or construction activity associated with the works, should be carried out in accordance with the with EPA Publication No. 275 Construction Techniques for Sediment Pollution Control (May 1991).
- The construction site must be managed in accordance with EPA Publication No. 981 Reducing Stormwater Pollution from Construction Sites (May 2005).
- Any water flows from any newly created impervious area must be directed to the legal point of discharge and not onto any adjacent Crown land without the consent of the relevant land manager.
- Prior to works commencing, a Construction Environmental Management Plan (CEMP) must be prepared to the satisfaction of Glen Eira City Council and Caulfield Racecourse Reserve Trust.
- Development works on the land must be undertaken in accordance with the endorsed CEMP.
- All works must be completed and maintained to the satisfaction of Caulfield Racecourse Reserve Trust.
- At the completion of the works the site must be remediated to the satisfaction of Caulfield Racecourse Reserve Trust.
- Any landscaping/site remediation associated with the use and/or development must protect retained native vegetation.
- This consent will expire if the works are not completed within four years of the date of issue, unless an extension of time is applied for and granted by the Program Manager Planning Approvals, Land and Built Environment Programs, Port Phillip Region, Department of Transport and Planning.

For the Motion: Crs Esakoff, Magee and Cade (3)

Against the Motion: Crs Parasol, Zmood and Pennicuik (3)

Mayor's casting vote: For the Motion

CARRIED

#### **Extension of Speaking Time**

Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Magee

That Cr Pennicuik be granted a two minute extension of speaking time.

# **Extension of Speaking Time**

Moved: Cr Magee Seconded: Cr Pennicuik

That Cr Zmood be granted a one minute extension of speaking time.

# **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

# **Extension of Speaking Time**

Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Magee

That Cr Esakoff be granted a one minute extension of speaking time.

# **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

8.4	226 HAWTHORN ROAD CAULFIELD NORTH				
	Moved: Cr Zmood	Seconded: Cr Esakoff			
	That Council issues a Notice of Decision to Grant a Planning Permit for Application No. GE/PP-36130/2023 at 226 Hawthorn Road, Caulfield North in accordance with the following:				
	Permit preamble				
	office, alteration of access to a Tr	ked use building comprising 7 dwellings and an ansport Zone 2 and reduction in car parking office use with the following planning permissions:			
	Use of the land as dwelling metres (Clause 34.01-1)	where the frontage at ground level exceeds 2			
<ul> <li>To construct a building or construct or carry out works</li> <li>Reduce the number of car parking spaces required ur relation to the office use</li> </ul>	• • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •				
		a Transport Zone 2 (Clause 52.29-2)			
	Permit conditions				
	Amended plans				
	Before the development or	use starts, amended plans and documents to the			

satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the plans will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The plans must be drawn to scale with dimensions and must be generally in accordance with the advertised plans identified as Drawing Nos. TP02.1, TP02.2, TP02.3, TP02.4, TP02.5, TP02.6, TP02.7, TP03.1, TP03.2, TP04.1, TP06.1, TP06.2, TP07.1, and TP07.2, revision B – dated 28/08/2023, and prepared by Metaxas, but further modified to show:

- a) Removal of level 2 which contains four dwellings, and consequential reduction in the overall height, with any additional required changes contained wholly within the approved building envelope;
- b) A Landscape Plan in accordance with Condition 3 of this permit;
- c) A Landscape Management Plan in accordance with Condition 4 of this permit;
- d) A Waste Management Plan in accordance with Condition 8 of this permit;
- e) A Sustainable Management Plan in accordance with Condition 10 of this permit, with the following delineated on the plans:
  - (i) Angle and system size in watts for the rooftop solar PV panels;
  - (ii) Reduction in north and east-facing glazing of Dwelling 301 by 30 per cent;
  - (iii) Glazing for all dwellings to be a VLT of 60 or higher;
  - (iv) Operable windows/doors on the north, east, and south of Dwelling 301. The eastern façade must have a minimum of two full panel door openings adjoining the living/dining area;
  - (v) Operable windows to all bathrooms;
  - (vi) Fixed, external, horizontal shading devices to the north-facing windows and glazed doors of Dwelling 301. Shading devices must not extend to within 1 metre of a property boundary. A dimensioned sectional diagram or photograph of shading devices must be shown on the plans. Shading devices should be in accordance with the 25 per cent shading formula of *Energy Smart Housing Manual – Sustainable Victoria*;
  - (vii) External operable shading devices to all east-facing glazing of habitable rooms of Dwelling 301, and all west-facing glazing of habitable rooms and glazed doors of Dwellings 302 and 303. The shading devices must be operable from within the dwelling. A dimensioned sectional diagram or photograph must be shown on the plans;
  - (viii) EV charging infrastructure and cabling that can support Level 2 (Mode 3) 32 Amp EV car charging, and in compliance with applicable NCC requirements;
  - (ix) Tap and floor waste on all balconies, courtyards, and roof terrace; and
  - (x) SCRN2 material to the stairwell (North Elevation) changed to a lighter colour with a solar absorbance less than or equal to 0.60 (medium). Where possible, glass blocks should be used to reduce the need for artificial light.
- (f) Any requirements as a result of Condition 18 (Head, Transport for Victoria);
- (g) The verandah along the Hawthorn Road frontage extended to 750mm from the kerb line, whilst maintaining a minimum height clearance above the footpath of 3.0m;

- (h) Relocation of commercial bin storage to outside of the office floor area, and located so it is directly accessible from the car park;
- (i) An enlarged sectional diagram to demonstrate overlooking impacts from the balconies of Dwellings 103 and 104, depicting view lines from a height of 1.7m immediately adjacent the rear of the planter box for a distance of 9.0m laterally.
- (j) An enlarged sectional diagram of the balcony privacy screens for the west facing level 2 and 3 balconies, detailing the size, angle and spacings of the horizontal slates.
- (k) An annotation for each adaptable bathroom to have showers that will be hobless (step-free) and doors with readily removable hinges;
- (I) An annotation for basement storage areas to be allocated in accordance with the volume requirements of Table D10 to Standard D21 of Clause 58.05-4;
- (m) The Fire Booster cupboard relocated to be adjacent and orientated towards the vehicle accessway (ie. between the office and accessway), or written confirmation from the relevant authority that this location is not compliant with the relevant industry standard;
- (n) An elevation plan of all ground floor site services which can be viewed from the street frontage, drawn to a scale of 1:20, fully dimensioned showing the height and width of service cabinets and any required identification signage;
- (o) An annotation for the proposed model of car stacker system, its dimensions for usable platform width, total bay width, length, vehicle height clearance and car stacker pit depth to accommodate the system; and
- (p) Bicycle parking spaces fully dimensioned in accordance with the requirements of Clause 52.34-6 (Design of bicycle spaces).

# Layout must not be altered

2. The development and layout and description of the uses as shown on the endorsed plans must not be altered or modified (unless the Glen Eira Planning Scheme specifies a permit is not required) except with the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

## Landscape plan

- 3. Before the development starts, a detailed landscape plan to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved the plan will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The landscape plan must be prepared by a person suitably qualified or experienced in landscape design and must be drawn to scale with dimensions. All species selected must be to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority. The landscape plan must show how the landscaping design meets the canopy cover, deep soil and tree type requirements of Standard D10 of Clause 58.03-5, through submission of the following:
  - (a) A site plan that indicates:
    - (i) The required number of canopy trees. Where the minimum number of canopy trees is not provided, indicate how the alternate solution provides suitable canopy cover;
    - (ii) Deep soil areas and planter boxes; and

- (iii) Areas of outdoor communal open space and private open space.
- (b) Sections indicating the location and dimensions of the required canopy trees, deep soil areas and planter boxes;
- (c) A development summary table that includes:
  - (i) The site area;
  - (ii) The required number of canopy cover for the site;
  - (iii) The number of canopy trees on the site and their size in diameter and the total amount of canopy cover provided for the site; and
  - (iv) The required deep soil area for the site, the amount provided and/or planter box soil volumes provided.
- (d) A planting schedule of all proposed vegetation including botanical names, common names, pot sizes, sizes at maturity, quantities of each plant, and details of surface finishes of pathways and driveways;
- (e) Landscaping and planting within all planter box areas, including a minimum of one tree within the rooftop planter box for the purpose of providing shade to the adjoining communal area;
- (f) Advanced canopy trees (minimum 2.0 metres tall when planted unless otherwise agreed to in writing by the Responsible Authority) in the following areas:
  - (i) 3 trees within the rear setback;

Or 3 trees as above in locations to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

- (g) Details of how landscaping assets to be installed including details of:
  - (i) An automatic irrigation system for all landscaped areas;
  - (ii) The irrigation sources, supply and connection points.
- (h) Notes and diagrams detailing the establishment of all proposed trees, shrubs and ground covers.
- 4. Before the development starts, a detailed Landscape Management Plan to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved the plan will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The detailed Landscape Management Plan must be prepared by a person suitably qualified or experienced in landscape management and must be consistent with the landscape plan required by Condition 3 of this permit. The Landscape Management Plan must include:
  - (a) Details of a maintenance program for the irrigation systems including flushing, checking systems integrity, monitoring sensors and calibration settings.
  - (b) The allocation of responsibility to the owners corporation for the ongoing maintenance of the irrigation systems and all landscaping unless otherwise to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority, including specific measures relating to:
    - (i) maintenance of the proposed on-structure landscaping; and
    - (ii) obligations on the owners corporation to ensure consistent

maintenance and matching themes for the landscaping into the future.

- (c) Notes and diagrams detailing the maintenance of all proposed trees, shrubs, and ground covers.
- (d) Protocols for gaining access for maintenance purposes to privately owned land.

#### Completion of landscaping

5. Before the building is occupied, or by such later date as approved in writing by the Responsible Authority, the landscaping works shown on the endorsed Landscaping Plan must be carried out and completed to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

# Construction Management Plan

- 6. Before each stage of the development starts (Stage 1: Demolition, Stage 2: Excavation, and Stage 3: Construction), a Construction Management Plan (CMP) to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the plan will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The CMP must show, as relevant to each stage:
  - (a) Construction activity must only occur between the hours of 7.00 am and 6.00 pm, Monday to Friday, 9.00 am to 3.00 pm on Saturday and no construction on Sunday and Public Holidays;
  - (b) Measures to control noise, dust, erosion, sediment, stormwater, litter and other construction waste and any chemical contamination;
  - (c) Measures to maintain safe, navigable and step-free public access around and past the site;
  - (d) Measures to prevent silt or other pollutants from entering into any underground drainage system or gutters within the surrounding road network:
  - (e) A plan showing the location and design of a vehicle wash-down bay for construction vehicles on the site;
  - (f) Measures relating to the cleaning and maintaining of surrounding road surfaces;
  - (g) A site plan showing the location of any site sheds, on-site amenities, building waste storage and the like;
  - (h) A plan showing the location of parking areas for construction and subcontractors' vehicles on and surrounding the site, to ensure vehicles associated with construction activity cause minimum disruption to surrounding premises.;
  - (i) Delivery and unloading points and expected frequency;
  - (i) A traffic management plan showing truck routes to and from the site;
  - (k) Swept path analysis demonstrating the ability of trucks to enter/exit the site in a safe manner for the largest anticipated truck associated with the construction;
  - (I) An outline of requests to occupy public footpaths or roads, or anticipated disruptions to local services;
  - (m) Measures relating to public safety and site security including the delivery and removal of materials from the site:
  - (n) Any construction lighting designed, baffled and located to prevent any

- adverse effect from light spill to the amenity of abutting and adjoining land:
- (o) Measures to ensure that subcontractors/tradespeople operating on the site are aware of the contents of the construction management plan;
- (p) Contact details of key construction site staff; and
- (q) Any other relevant matters including the requirements of VicRoads, the Department of Transport and Council Local Laws.
- 7. All construction (including demolition and excavation) must be carried out and complied with in accordance with the approved Construction Management Plan to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

## Waste Management Plan

- 8. Before the development starts, an amended Waste Management Plan (WMP) to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the WMP will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The WMP must be generally in accordance with the WMP dated 12 May 2023 and prepared by Ratio, but further modified to show:
  - (a) Employment of someone for the purpose of transporting bins to/from the kerbside collection point for the purpose of minimising the length of collection times:
  - (b) Collection times to be limited to between 6am and 7am on a weekday or Saturday; and
  - (c) Swept path assessment showing that the mini-lifter waste collection truck can stage to the front of the site between two occupied car spaces either side of the crossover, and clear of the tram tracks.
- 9. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed Waste Management Plan must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

## Sustainable Management Plan

- 10. Before the development starts, an amended Sustainable Management Plan (SMP) to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the SMP will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The SMP must be generally in accordance with the SMP dated 28 July 2023 and prepared by Sustainable Built Environments, but further modified to show:
  - (a) Removal of Management BESS 3.2 credit;
  - (b) Removal of Water BESS 4.1 credit;
  - (c) Clarification of proposed solar PV system angle;
  - (d) Updated daylight model for Dwelling 301;
  - (e) Daylight model for living/kitchen areas of Dwellings 102 and 103 demonstrating they pass relevant BESS requirements;
  - (f) Removal of western wall from IEQ BESS 3.4 credit;
  - (g) Removal of on-ground communal area and inclusion of communal roof terrace;

- (h) An Implementation Report;
- (i) A Stormwater Treatment Maintenance Plan; and
- (j) A Construction Management Water Sensitive Urban Design report

Any design features required to meet the recommendations of the SMP must be included and shown on the plans.

11. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed Sustainable Management Plan must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the written approval of the Responsible Authority.

# Car parking layout and access

- 12. Before the use starts or the building is occupied, the areas set aside for the parking of vehicles and access lanes as shown on the endorsed plans must be:
  - (a) Fully constructed;
  - (b) Properly formed to such levels that may be used in accordance with the plans;
  - (c) Surfaced with an all weather surface or seal coat (as appropriate);
  - (d) Drained and maintained in a continuously usable condition;
  - (e) Line marked to indicate each car space, loading bay and/or access lane; and
  - (f) Clearly marked to show the direction of traffic along access lanes and driveways

all to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

# Number of car parking spaces

13. No fewer than one car parking space for each two bedroom dwelling, and two car parking spaces for each dwelling with three bedrooms must be provided on the land to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority.

## Provision of car stackers and ongoing maintenance

- 14. Before the building is occupied, a Car Stacker System Management Plan (CSSMP) to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority must be submitted to and approved by the Responsible Authority. When approved, the plan will be endorsed and will then form part of the permit. The CSSMP must show:
  - (a) Allocation of car spaces according to vehicle size and type;
  - (b) Ongoing maintenance of the car stacker system:
  - (c) Instructions to owners and occupiers about the operation of the car stacker system and EV Charging Station; and
  - (d) Communicating to prospective residents about the availability of car stacker spaces and sizes.
- 15. The provisions, recommendations and requirements of the endorsed Car Stacker System Management Plan must be implemented and complied with to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and must not be varied except with the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

### Screening of windows

16. Before the building is occupied, all screening shown on the endorsed plans must be installed and permanently maintained in accordance with the endorsed plans. The screening measures as shown on the endorsed plans are not to be altered or removed except with the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

#### Plant and equipment

17. No plant, equipment, services and substations other than those shown on the endorsed plans are permitted except with the prior written consent of the Responsible Authority.

## Head, Transport for Victoria

- 18. Prior to the endorsement of plans, amended plan(s) must be submitted to and approved by the Head, Transport for Victoria. When approved, the amended plan(s) must be endorsed by the Responsible Authority and will form part of the Permit. The plans must be drawn to scale with dimensions and generally in accordance with the submitted plan (Drawing 'Ground', Drawing No. TP02.2, Project No. 22.019, dated 10/ 03/ 2023, prepared by Metaxas Architects) but amended to show that the existing crossover being extended as such:
  - (a) It matches the proposed driveway at the property boundary.
  - (b) It appropriately accommodates the full swept paths of 2 vehicles entering and existing the site concurrently at the entrance (which are illustrated in the submitted Swept Path Assessment Sheet No.1 of the Traffic Impact Assessment Report dated 10/ 03/ 2023 by Ratio Consultants).
- 19. Prior to the occupation of the development hereby approved, the extended crossover must be constructed to the satisfaction of the Responsible Authority and at no cost to the Responsible Authority and the Head, Transport for Victoria.
- 20. All vehicles must enter and exit the site in a forward direction at all times.

#### Permit expiry

- 21. This Permit will expire if one of the following circumstances applies:
  - (a) The development is not started within three years of the date of this Permit.
  - (b) The development is not completed within five years of the date of this Permit.
  - (c) The use has not started within five years of the date of this Permit.
  - (d) The use is discontinued for a period of two years.

The Responsible Authority may extend the permit if a request is made in writing in accordance with Section 69 of *Planning and Environment Act 1987*.

#### Notes

- A. The Department of Transport and Planning advise the following:
  - The proposed development requires works within the road reserve. Separate approval under the *Road Management Act 2004* for this activity may be required from the Head, Transport for Victoria. Please contact the Department of Transport and Planning about working within the road reserve prior to commencing any works.
- B. The amendments specified in Condition 1 of this Permit and any additional modifications which are "necessary or consequential" are those that will be assessed by Council when plans are lodged to satisfy that condition. Any "necessary or consequential" amendments, in addition to those required by this condition, should be specifically brought to the attention of Council for assessment.

If other modifications are proposed, they must be identified and be of a nature that an application for amendment of permit may be lodged under Section 72 of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*. An amendment application is subject to the procedures set out in Section 73 of the *Planning and Environment Act 1987*.

- C. This Planning Permit represents the planning approval for the use and development of the land. This Planning Permit does not represent the approval of other departments of Glen Eira City Council or other statutory authorities. Such approvals may be required and may be assessed on different criteria from that adopted for the approval of this Planning Permit.
- D. Nothing in the grant of this Permit should be construed as granting any permission other than planning permission for the purpose described. It is the duty of the permit holder to acquaint themselves, and comply, with all other relevant legal obligations (including any obligation in relation to restrictive covenants and easements affecting the site) and to obtain other required permits, consents or approvals.
- E. Council's Strategic Transport Department advise the following:
  - Residents of the dwellings allowed under this permit will not be issued Residential Parking Permits (including visitor parking permits).
- F. Council's Asset Engineering Department advise the following:

#### Drainage

- Storm water runoff from the development must be via an outfall drain to Council's storm water pit/pipe located in front of 273 Hawthorn Road.
   The design and construction of the outfall drain must be approved by Engineering Assets and all costs associated with the outfall drain design and construction must be borne by the developer.
- Drainage associated with basement construction (seepage and agricultural waters are to be filtered to rainwater clarity) must be discharged to the nearest Council Drain/Pit and not be discharged to the kerb and channel.

- No net increase in peak stormwater runoff in Council drainage network is permitted. Post development peak storm water discharge to Council drainage network must be maintained to the predevelopment level for 10 year Average Recurrence Interval. Detailed plans and computations should be submitted to Council for approval prior to any construction works.
- All stormwater runoff must be connected to Council's underground drainage network. No uncontrolled stormwater discharge to adjoining properties and footpaths is permitted.

# General

- Any firefighting equipment for the building must be accommodated within title boundary. Firefighting facilities as required under the Building Act/Regulations must be within the subject land and not in the Council Road Reserve.
- The proposed pedestrian access must be Disability Discrimination Act compliant. The existing footpath levels must not be altered/modified to meet any compliance. It is the developer's responsibility to check all the internal levels with the existing footpath levels prior to commencement of any works.
- An Asset Protection Permit must be obtained from Council's Engineering Services Department before the development starts.
- All relevant Engineering Permits must be obtained before any works within the Road Reserve and/or stormwater connection to the Council drainage network.

For the Motion: Crs Esakoff, Zmood and Pennicuik (3)

Against the Motion: Crs Magee, Cade and Parasol (3)

Mayor's casting vote: For the Motion

CARRIED

#### **Extension of Speaking Time**

Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Parasol

That Cr Pennicuik be granted a one minute extension of speaking time.

8.5	MO	ORLE	IGH VILLAGE - FE	ES AND CHARGI	ES	
	Mov	/ed: C	r Magee	Seco	onded: Cr Zmo	ood
	Tha	t Cour	ncil:			
	1.	Villa char	ne number of days a ria: Whether there is li	and service fees in illage, so that a ut tenant provides the mited or no ability	n respect of the tility and servic heir service, su of for the comm	e adopted fees and se fee is proportionate ubject to the following
		b)	Council's strategic	direction, including	ng the <i>Glen Eil</i>	o has alignment with ra Community mmunity Wellbeing
	2.	Prop man redu	olves that the Director perties and Statutory lager with responsibuce utility and servic with the criteria in P	Building Service: ilities over leasing e fees for a tenan	s, or any subse g and licensing	equent director or
					CAF	RRIED UNANIMOUSI

8.6	OUR PRIORITIES, OUR FUTURE FINAL REPORT		
	Moved: Cr Esakoff	Seconded: Cr Zmood	
	report (Attachment 1) and Comr	rities, Our Future community engagement summary munity Priorities Panel final report (Attachment 3) ack and Panel recommendations to inform future	
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY	

8.7	REVIEW OF COMMUNITY GRANTS PROGRAM GUIDELINES 2024-2025			
	Moved: Cr Parasol	Seconded: Cr Pennicuik		
	That Council adopts the revised <i>Community Grants Program Guidelines 2024-2025</i> (Attachment 1).			
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY		

# **Change Order of Business**

Moved: Cr Cade Seconded: Cr Zmood

That Council changes the order of business to deal with item 8.15 Audit and Risk Committee Minutes at this stage of the meeting.

8.15	AUDIT & RISK COMMITTEE M	NUTES
	Moved: Cr Pennicuik	Seconded: Cr Magee
	That the minutes of the Audit and Risk Committee meeting held on 24 November 2023 as shown in Attachment 1 to the report be approved.	
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.8	COUNCILLOR CIVIC SUPPORT EXPENSES POLICY	
	Moved: Cr Esakoff	Seconded: Cr Magee
	That Council endorses the updated Councillor Civic Support and Expenses Policy attached to this report.	
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.9	COUNCILLOR GIFT POLICY
	Moved: Cr Esakoff Seconded: Cr Zmood
	That Council endorses the Councillor Gift Policy as attached to the report with the following change:
	a) Increase of the declaration threshold of a token gift from \$25 to \$50.
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.10	INFORMATION GOVERNANCE POLICY	
	Moved: Cr Pennicuik	Seconded: Cr Esakoff
	That Council approves the <i>Information Governance Policy</i> (Attachment 1).	
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.11	WORKPLACE TECHNOLOGY AND INFORMATION SECURITY POLICY		
	Moved: Cr Esakoff	Seconded: Cr Parasol	
	That Council approves the Work (Attachment 1).	kplace Technology and Information Security Policy	
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY	

8.12	TENDER 2023.105 FINANCIAL SYSTEM REPLACEMENT	
	Мо	ved: Cr Esakoff Seconded: Cr Parasol
		at Council having reviewed and considered the confidential Tender Evaluation port (Attachment 1 to this report):
	1.	appoints Counterpart Solutions (CPS), A.C.N. 164 532 209 as the provider under Tender number 2023.105 for an amount of \$1,861,540 exclusive of GST, subject to a suitable contract being negotiated;
	2.	authorises the CEO to finalise contract negotiations;
	3.	prepares the contract in accordance with the Conditions of Contract included in the tender;
	4.	authorises the CEO to execute the contract on Council's behalf;
	5.	notes the attachments to the report remain confidential in accordance with section 3(1)(g) and section 66(5) of the <i>Local Government Act 2020</i> or until Council resolves otherwise; and
	6.	authorises Council officers to disclose any confidential information in relation to this item, but only to the extent necessary to give effect to the resolution.
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

TENDER 2024.28 DISTRIBUTION OF GLEN EIRA NEWS		
Mov	ved: Cr Esakoff	Seconded: Cr Magee
		ed and considered the confidential tender evaluation report):
1.	Family Trust, trading a 450), as the contractor	Ltd, A.C.N. 050 274 872 as the trustee for the Wall as Impact Leaflet Distributors (A.B.N 32 871 263 r under Tender number 2024.28 for an amount in hedule of Rates submitted;
2.	prepares the contract in in the tender;	accordance with the Conditions of Contract included
3.	authorises the CEO to e	execute the contracts on Council's behalf;
4.	section 3(1)(g) and sect	o the report remain confidential in accordance with ion 66(5) of the <i>Local Government Act 2020</i> or until rise; and
5.		ers to disclose any confidential information in relation the extent necessary to give effect to the resolution.
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY
	Mov Tha repo 1.	Moved: Cr Esakoff  That Council having reviewer report (Attachment 1 to this report (Attachment 2 to the report (Attachment 2 to the report (Attachment 3 to the report (Attachment 4 to this repor

8.14	TENDER 2023.90 SUPPLY AND DELIVERY OF RETAIL PRODUCTS - GESAC		
	Moved	d: Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Esakoff
		Council having reviewed (attachment 1 to this repo	and considered the confidential Tender Evaluation rt):
	1.		o Pty Ltd, A.C.N. 637 890 558 as the panel er number 2023.90 in accordance with the itted;
	2.		Australia Pty Ltd, A.C.N. 167 300 361 as the Tender number 2023.90 in accordance with the itted;
	3.	606 790 as the panel co	Pty Ltd, trading as Zoggs Australia, A.C.N. 619 ontractor under Tender number 2023.90 in edule of Rates submitted;
	4.	Intandem, A.C.N. 78 87	r De Saumarez Group Unit Trust, trading as 0 806 708 as the panel contractor under Tender ordance with the Schedule of Rates submitted;
	5.		Ltd, A.C.N. 110 453 319 as the panel contractor 2023.90 in accordance with the Schedule of Rates
	6.		alia Pty Ltd, A.C.N. 050 097 375 as the panel er number 2023.90 in accordance with the itted;
	7.		I, A.C.N. 110 472 707 as the panel contractor 2023.90 in accordance with the Schedule of Rates
	8.		mpany Pty Ltd, A.C.N. 111 108 251 as the panel er number 2023.90 in accordance with the itted;
	9.	prepares the contracts in included in the tender;	accordance with the Conditions of Contract
	10.	authorises the CEO to ex	recute the contracts on Council's behalf;
	11.		the report remain confidential in accordance with on 66(5) of the <i>Local Government Act 2020</i> or until se; and
	12.		rs to disclose any confidential information in relation ne extent necessary to give effect to the resolution.
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Item 8.15 was heard at an earlier stage of the meeting.

8.16	INSTRUMENT FOR APPOINTMENT AND AUTHORISATION OF AUTHORISED OFFICERS AND INFRINGEMENT PENALTIES	
	Moved: Cr Esakoff	Seconded: Cr Magee
		the powers relevantly conferred by sections 147(4) int Act 1987, 313 of the Local Government Act 2020 afety Act 1986, resolves that:
		attached Instruments of Appointment and g and Environment Act 1987 (Instruments) be tout in the Instruments;
	and Environment Act 1987 to th	ppointment and Authorisation under the <i>Planning</i> e officers referred to in the attached Instruments be pon the Instruments referred to in paragraph to effect;
	3. the Instruments be signed an	d sealed;
	4. each of the Instruments come Council is affixed to the Instrum	es into force immediately after the common seal of ent; and
	specified in Column 7 of the tab in Attachment 2 is the penalty p the Road Safety Road Rules 20	7(4A) of the <i>Road Safety Act 1986</i> , the penalty le titled "Prescribed Parking Infringement Penalties" rescribed for the parking infringements in breach of 17 specified in Column 4 of the table when the he municipal district of Glen Eira.
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

# **Meeting Extension**

Moved: Cr Cade Seconded: Cr Zmood

That Council extend the meeting time to 11pm.

8.17	MAYORAL TRAINING AND DEVELOPMENT	
	Moved: Cr Zmood	Seconded: Cr Magee
	That Council, approves expenditure of \$5,500 inclusive of GST for a professional development program for Mayor, Cr Anne-Marie Cade by Ruth McGowan Pty Ltd.	
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.18	CONSIDERATION OF A TREE AT 48 EMILY ST, CARNEGIE FOR INCLUSION IN THE CLASSIFIED TREE REGISTER	
	Moved: Cr Esakoff Seconded: Cr Magee	
	That Council:	
	1. Does not include the following tree in the Classified Tree Register:	
	<ul> <li>a) Lemon Scented Gum (Corymbia citriodora) located at 48 Emily St,</li> <li>Carnegie – 415/CTR/2022;</li> </ul>	
	2. notifies each person who nominated the tree detailed in this report; and	
	3. notifies all relevant landholders of the tree detailed in this report.	
	For the Motion: Crs Esakoff, Magee, Cade, Parasol and Zmood (5)	
	Against the Motion: Cr Pennicuik (1)	
	CARRIED	

# **Extension of Speaking Time**

Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Magee

That Cr Pennicuik be granted a two minute extension of speaking time.

**CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY** 

# **Extension of Speaking Time**

Moved: Cr Magee Seconded: Cr Esakoff

That Cr Zmood be granted a two minute extension of speaking time.

9.	URGENT BUSINESS
	Nil.
10.	ORDINARY BUSINESS
	10.1 Requests for reports from a member of Council staff Nil.
	10.2 Right of reply Nil.
	10.3 Notice of Motion Nil.
	10.4 Councillor questions Nil.
	10.5 Written public questions to Council Heard at an earlier stage of the meeting.
11.	CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS
	Nil.
12.	CLOSURE OF MEETING
	The meeting closed at 10.07pm.
	Confirmed this 6 February 2024
	Chairperson