

GLEN EIRA CITY COUNCIL

ORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING

TUESDAY 28 NOVEMBER 2023

MINUTES

Meeting was held in the Council Chambers, Corner Hawthorn & Glen Eira Roads, Caulfield at 7.30pm

Present

The Mayor, Councillor Anne-Marie Cade Councillor Tony Athanasopoulos Councillor Jim Magee Councillor Sam Parasol Councillor Sue Pennicuik Councillor Li Zhang Councillor Simone Zmood

INDEX

	4
APOLOGIES	4
REMINDER TO DECLARE ANY CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN ANY ITEMS O THE AGENDA	
CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS	6
RECEPTION AND READING OF PETITIONS AND JOINT LETTERS	6
5.1 Petition: SAVE OUR CENTRES	6
REPORTS BY DELEGATES APPOINTED BY COUNCIL TO VARIOUS ORGANISATIONS	6
Cr Pennicuik – Victorian Local Governance Association	
REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND RECORDS OF ASSEMBLY	7
7.1 Advisory Committees	7
7.1.1 Advisory Committee Minutes	7
7.2 Records of Assembly	7
7.2.1 Records of Assemblies of Councillors	7
OFFICER REPORTS (AS LISTED)	8
 8.1 Financial Management Report (31 October 2023) 8.2 Quarterly Service Performance Report (July - Sept 2023) 8.3 Bentleigh East Neighbourhood Activity Centre - Consideration of 	8
8.4 Compliance with Condition 38 of the Planning Permit for 10-16 Selwyn	
 8.5 Elsternwick Structure Plan 2023 - Planning Scheme Amendment	10 11 11 12 12 13 13
	APOLOGIES REMINDER TO DECLARE ANY CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN ANY ITEMS OF THE AGENDA CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS RECEPTION AND READING OF PETITIONS AND JOINT LETTERS 5.1 Petition: SAVE OUR CENTRES REPORTS BY DELEGATES APPOINTED BY COUNCIL TO VARIOUS ORGANISATIONS Cr Pennicuik – Victorian Local Governance Association REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND RECORDS OF ASSEMBLY 7.1 Advisory Committees 7.1.1 Advisory Committees Minutes 7.2.2 Records of Assembly 7.2.1 Records of Assembly 8.1 Financial Management Report (31 October 2023) 8.2 Quarterly Service Performance Report (July - Sept 2023) 8.3 Bentleigh East Neighbourhood Activity Centre - Consideration of Submissions to Amendment. 8.4 Compliance with Condition 38 of the Planning Permit for 10-16 Selwyn Street Elsternwick 8.5 Elsternwick 8.5 Elsternwick 8.6 Carnegie Major Activity Centre - Planning Scheme Amendment. 8.7 Bentleigh Structure Plan community engagement summary report. 8.8 Better Structure Plan community engagement summary report. 8.8 Better Structure Plan community engagement summary report. 8.8<

	8.13 2024 Ordinary Council Meeting dates	. 14
	8.14 Agreement for Access to Rippon Lea Gardens - Agreement renewal	. 15
	8.15 Tender 2024.3 Rosstown Aged Care Facility Demolition	. 15
	8.16 Council Lease for Telecommunications Equipment at Princes Park	. 16
	8.17 Establishment of a Southeastern Councils Biodiversity Network - Progress	
	update	
	8.18 VCAT Watch	
9.	URGENT BUSINESS	. 17
•		
10.	ORDINARY BUSINESS	. 17
		47
	10.1 Requests for reports from a member of Council staff	
	10.2 Right of reply	
	10.3 Notice of Motion	
	10.4 Councillor questions	
	10.5 Written public questions to Council	. 17
11.	CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS	. 30
	Nil	
12.	CLOSURE OF MEETING	20
14.		. 50



1. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The Mayor read the acknowledgement.

Glen Eira City Council Acknowledges the peoples of the Kulin Nation as Traditional Owners and Custodians, and pay our respect to their Elders past, present and emerging. We Acknowledge and uphold their continuing relationship to land and waterways. Council extends its respect to all Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples.

2. APOLOGIES

Apology Seconded: Cr Magee Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Magee That the apology from Cr Esakoff be received and noted. CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

3. REMINDER TO DECLARE ANY CONFLICTS OF INTEREST IN ANY ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

Councillors were reminded of the requirement for disclosure of conflicts of interest in relation to items listed for consideration on the Agenda, or any item that was considered at this meeting, in accordance with Section 130(2) of the *Local Government Act 2020* and Rule 60(3) of the Glen Eira City Council Governance Rules. Councillors were then invited to indicate any such conflict of interest.

Nil

Procedural Motion

Moved: Cr Cade

Seconded: Cr Zmood

That Council:

- 1. where meetings are held in-person, can continue the meeting if the livestream of the meeting fails as stated in the governance rules;
- 2. considers the meeting to be adjourned for 10 minutes from the commencement of any technical problem where a Councillor is participating virtually; and
- 3. where a Councillor is participating virtually and the meeting cannot be resumed within 30 minutes from the commencement of the technical problem, the meeting is to be reconvened on Wednesday 29 November 2023 at 7.30pm.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Suspend Standing Orders

Moved: Cr Cade

Seconded: Cr Pennicuik

That Council suspend standing orders at 7.39pm.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Condolence from the Mayor and Councillors on the passing of Cr Dr David Zyngier

Resume Standing Orders	
Moved: Cr Cade	Seconded: Cr Parasol
That Council resumes standing orders at 8.03pm.	

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Public Participation

This evening we had 10 submitters request to speak to Council during Public Participation. Due to the time limit of 15 minutes, 8 speakers spoke to Council during Public Participation.

4. CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES OF PREVIOUS COUNCIL MEETINGS

Moved: Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Zmood
	Ordinary Council Meeting held on 8 November 2023 and eting held on 21 November 2023 be confirmed.
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. RECEPTION AND READING OF PETITIONS AND JOINT LETTERS

5.1 PETITION: SAVE OUR CENTRES

Moved: Cr Athanasopoulos Seconded: Cr Zhang
That Council:
1. receives and notes the petition; and
2. refers this petition to the relevant officers for consideration including a detailed response to the submitter.
CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. REPORTS BY DELEGATES APPOINTED BY COUNCIL TO VARIOUS ORGANISATIONS

Cr Pennicuik – Victorian Local Governance Association

7. REPORTS FROM COMMITTEES AND RECORDS OF ASSEMBLY

7.1 Advisory Committees

7.1.1	.1 ADVISORY COMMITTEE MINUTES	
	Moved: Cr Parasol	Seconded: Cr Pennicuik
	That the minutes of the Advisory Committee meetings as shown below be received and noted and that the recommendations of these Committees be adopted.	
	1. Arts and Culture Advisory Co	mmittee Minutes 17 October 2023;
	2. Glen Eira Sustainability Advis	ory Committee Minutes of 19 October 2023
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7.2 Records of Assembly

7.2.1	RECORDS OF ASSEMBLIES OF COUNCILLORS		
	Мо	ved: Cr Athanasopoulos	Seconded: Cr Magee
	That the Records of Assemblies as shown below be received and noted.		
	1.	24 October 2023 Assembly;	
	2.	31 October 2023 Assembly; a	nd
	3.	8 November 2023 Pre-meeting] .
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. OFFICER REPORTS (AS LISTED)

8.1	FINANCIAL MANAGEMENT REPORT (31 OCTOBER 2023)	
	Moved: Cr Pennicuik	Seconded: Cr Magee
	That Council notes the Finance October 2023.	ial Management Report for the period ending 31
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Extension of Speaking Time	
Moved: Cr Zmood	Seconded: Cr Zhang
That Cr Magee be granted a tw	o minute extension of speaking time.
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.2	QUARTERLY SERVICE PERFORMANCE REPORT (JULY - SEPT 2023)		
	Moved: Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Zmood	
	That Council notes the <i>Quarterly Service Performance Report</i> for the period ending 30 September 2023 (Attachment 1 to this report).		
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY	

8.3 BENTLEIGH EAST NEIGHBOURHOOD ACTIVITY CENTRE - CONSIDERATION OF SUBMISSIONS TO AMENDMENT

Moved:	Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Zhang
That Co	ouncil:	
1.		Ibmissions received following the exhibition of to the Glen Eira Planning Scheme.
2.	•	t and Attachment 1 to this report – Amendment s and Officer Responses.
3.	panel to consider all s	for Planning appoints an independent planning ubmissions received during the exhibition period for in accordance with Section 23 of the <i>Planning and</i>
4.	Refers all submissions consideration.	to an independent planning panel for
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Procedural Motion

г

Т

Moved: Cr Zmood

Seconded: Cr Pennicuik

That Item 8.4 be deferred to the 19 December 2023 Ordinary Meeting of Council.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.4	COMPLIANCE WITH CONDITION 38 OF THE PLANNING PERMIT FOR 10-16 SELWYN STREET ELSTERNWICK
	RECOMMENDATION
	 That Council: 1. notes the report. 2. notes Condition 38 of Planning Permit GE/DP-34187/2021 has been satisfied and discharged.
	DEFERRED

8.5	ELSTERNWICK STRUCTURE PLAN 2023 - PLANNING SCHEME AMENDMEN			INDMENT			
	Move	d: Cr Magee		Sec	conded: Cr Ath	anasopoul	OS
	That C	Council:					
	1.		chedule 10 to Cla t 1 to this report)		2 Design and De	evelopment	Overlay
	2.	endorses th report.	e proposed rezo	ning of lan	d listed in Table	1 and Tab	le 2 of this
	3.	Activity Cer	ne proposed char htre boundary, an Background Docu	d the inclu	sion of the Elste	ernwick Stru	ucture Plan
	4.	to the Glen	orisation from the Eira Planning Sc nd Environment A	heme in a			
	5.	Amendmen the Departn	the Manager City t, including chang nent of Transport o not affect the pu	ges reques t and Planr	sted by the Minis	ster for Plar authorisation	nning or
	6.	exhibits the Planning ar	eceiving authoris proposed ameno d Environment A or a period of six	dment in a Act 1987 ar	ccordance with	Section 19	of the
	7.		as part of the stat the public where				be
	For the	e Motion:	Crs Athanasop	oulos, Mag	jee, Cade and Z	'hang (4)	
	Agains	st the Motion	: Crs Parasol, Zr	nood and I	Pennicuik (3)		
							<u>CARRIED</u>

Extension of Speaking Time				
Moved: Cr Zmood	Seconded: Cr Athanasopoulos			
That Cr Pennicuik be granted a two minute extension of speaking time.				
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY			

8.6	CARNEGIE MAJOR ACTIVITY CENTRE - PLANNING SCHEME AMENDMENT		
	Mov	ed: Cr Athanasopoulos	Seconded: Cr Magee
	That	t Council:	
	1.	-	ally considered all submissions received in Amendment C237glen to the Glen Eira Planning
	2.		r response to the issues raised by the e report at Attachment 1 – Summary of ponses.
	3.	Panel, the recommended cha preferred version of clauses 0 Carnegie Structure Plan 2022	advocacy before an Independent Planning nges to Amendment C237, including Council's 2.03, 02.04, 11.03, 15.01, 16.01, 18.02, and Schedule 9 to the Design and erally as contained in Attachments 2, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8
	4.	to consider all submissions re	ning to appoint an Independent Planning Panel ferred to in relation to Amendment C237 in f the <i>Planning and Environment Act 19</i> 87.
	5.		ncluding late submissions received up to the pendent Planning Panel for its consideration.
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.7	BENTLEIGH STRUCTURE PI REPORT	AN COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT SUMMARY
	Moved: Cr Zhang	Seconded: Cr Zmood
		nity feedback in the community engagement entleigh Structure Plan 2023 (Attachment 1).
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Meeting Extension

Moved: Cr Athanasopoulos

Seconded: Cr Magee

That the meeting be extended to conclude at 11pm.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.8	BETTER STREETS, BETTER PLACES - GLEN EIRA'S 10 YEAR ACTIVITY CENTRE STREETSCAPE IMPROVEMENTS PROGRAM 2023			
	Moved: Cr Athanasopoulos	Seconded: Cr Parasol		
	That Council:			
	1. adopts Better Streets, Better Streetscape Improvement P	r Places 2023 – Glen Eira's Activity Centre Program 2023-2033.		
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY		

8.9	UPDATED CLASSIFIED TREE POLICY
	Moved: Cr Zmood Seconded: Cr Pennicuik
	That Council:
	1. endorse the attached amended Classified Tree Policy.
	2. Support the approach of receiving a quarterly report from officers in relation to the trees that have met the selection criteria with no objection.
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.10	INCLUSION OF 4 TREES IN THE CLASSIFIED TREE REGISTER
	Moved: Cr Pennicuik Seconded: Cr Zmood
	That Council:
	1. includes the following trees in the Classified Tree Register:
	 Southern Blue Gum (Eucalyptus bicostata) located at 85 Tucker Rd, Bentleigh – 321/CTR/2021;
	 Spotted Gum (Corymbia maculata) located at Glen Huntly Reserve, Glen Huntly – 391/CTR/2022;
	 c. River Red Gum (Eucalyptus camaldulensis) located in Glen Huntly Reserve, Glen Huntly – 391/CTR/2022;
	2. Defers the decision for consideration of the following tree for inclusion in the Classified Tree Register until the 19 December 2023 Council Meeting:
	 a. Lemon Scented Gum (Corymbia citriodora) located at 48 Emily St, Carnegie – 415/CTR/2022
	3. notifies each person who nominated a tree detailed in this report;
	4. notifies all relevant landholders of the trees detailed in this report; and
	 authorises a notice to be published in the Victorian Government Gazette of the decision to include the trees outlined in this report in the Classified Tree Register.
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.11	COMPLAINTS HANDLING POLICY			
	Moved: Cr Zmood	Seconded: Cr Pennicuik		
	That Council adopts the updated Complaints Handling Policy as shown in Attachment 1 of this report.			
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY		

8.12	FRAUD AND CORRUPTION POLICY & PROCEDURE		
	Moved: Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Parasol	
	That Council approves the updated Fraud and Corruption Policy and Procedure (Attachment 1).		
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY	

8.13	2024 ORDINARY COUNCIL MEETING DATES		
	Moved: Cr Zmood	Seconded: Cr Athanasopoulos	
	That Council:		
	1. adopts the following data Glen Eira City Council:	es for the 2024 Ordinary Council Meetings for the	
	 Tuesday 6 February 20 Tuesday 27 February 20 Tuesday 19 March 202 Tuesday 9 April 2024 Wednesday 1 May 2024 Tuesday 21 May 2024 Thursday 13 June 2020 Tuesday 2 July 2024 Tuesday 23 July 2024 Tuesday 13 August 20 Tuesday 3 September Tuesday 15 October 20 Tuesday 12 November Tuesday 3 December 20 	2024 24 24 4 24 24 2024 2024 2024 2024	
	Tuesday 17 December		
	Chambers, Corner Hawi necessary under Rule 6 and any relevant laws, r	ed meetings are to be held at 7.30pm in the Council thorn & Glen Eira Roads, Caulfield, unless it is 3 of the Glen Eira City Council Governance Rules egulations, or instructions from relevant authorities, ctronic means of communication.	
	CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY		

8.14	AGREEMENT FOR ACCESS TO RIPPON LEA GARDENS - AGREEMENT RENEWAL		
	Мо	ved: Cr Zmood	Seconded: Cr Parasol
	Tha	at Council:	
	1.	authorise officers to enter into a National Trust of Australia (Victor	further three-year agreement with the pria) (NTAV); and
	2.	endorses the payment of \$250, Australia (Victoria) (NTAV) for t	000 per annum to the National Trust of he next three budget cycles.
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.15	TEN	DER 2024.3 ROSSTOWN AG	ED CARE FACILITY DEMOLITION
	Mov	ed: Cr Athanasopoulos	Seconded: Cr Zmood
		Council having reviewed and rt (attachment 1 to this report):	considered the confidential Tender Evaluation
	1.	•••	n & Excavation Pty Ltd, A.C.N. 126 393 815 as r number 2024.3 for an amount of \$436,550.00, Sum submitted;
	2.	prepares the contract in acco in the tender;	rdance with the Conditions of Contract included
	3.	authorises the CEO to execut	e the contract on Council's behalf;
	4.		ve variations to this contract in accordance with fidential attachment to this report;
	5.		report remain confidential in accordance with ວິ(5) of the <i>Local Government Act 2020</i> or until nd
	6.		disclose any confidential information in relation tent necessary to give effect to the resolution.
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Extension of Speaking Time

Moved: Cr Zmood

Seconded: Cr Pennicuik

That Cr Magee be granted a two minute extension of speaking time.

CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.16	COUNCIL LEASE FOR TELECOMMUNICATIONS EQUIPMENT AT PRINCES PARK		
	Mov	ed: Cr Magee	Seconded: Cr Zmood
	That	Council:	
	1.		/ lease with Amplitel Pty Limited (ACN 648 133 073) uncil premises located at Princes Park, 41 Sussex
	2.	execute the lease in an a seal.	ppropriate manner including affixing the common
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.17	ESTABLISHMENT OF A SOUTHEASTERN COUNCILS BIODIVERSITY NETWORK - PROGRESS UPDATE		
	Mov	ed: Cr Pennicuik	Seconded: Cr Zmood
	That	Council:	
	1.		es to collaborate and share information with aditional Owners more broadly;
	2.	improvement and activities	every six months on the progress of biodiversity across the region that is also published on the site, starting from March 2024;
	3.		pdates with all Southeast Councils as the naring and continued network building; and
	4.	Continue to work with exist their charters and terms of	ng networks to integrate the key objectives into reference.
			CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8.18	VCAT WATCH		
	Moved: Cr Athanasopoulos	Seconded: Cr Magee	
	That Council notes the update on Victorian Civil and Administrative Tribunal matters.		
		CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY	

It is recorded that Cr Zhang vacated the Chamber at 10:23pm.

It is recorded that Cr Zhang entered the Chamber at 10:25pm.

9. URGENT BUSINESS

Nil

10. ORDINARY BUSINESS

10.1 Requests for reports from a member of Council staff

Nil

10.2 Right of reply

Cr Magee – spoke on an article in the Age that incorrectly referenced him being associated to a political party of which he is not.

10.3 Notice of Motion

Nil

10.4 Councillor questions

Nil

10.5 Written public questions to Council

This evening we had 79 Written Public Questions submitted to Council. 29 questions were able to read and responded to during the timeframe provided.

The minutes display those questions that were read and responded to during the Council meeting. All 79 questions will receive a formal response in writing.

<u>Written Public Questions to Council – 28 November 2023 Council Meeting</u>

1	
Sue Nolle	Question 1
Caulfield	Cats are killers. Cats wander and seek out prey. Organisations dedicated to rehoming cute faced kittens promote the notion that cats are harmless pets.
	What is Council doing to counteract the ongoing environmental damage caused by domesticated cats?
	ANSWER:
	Council's Domestic Animal Management Plan 2022-2025 (DAMP) seeks to minimise nuisance behaviour which includes wandering cats.
	The DAMP outlines the programs, services and strategies in place that are planned to minimise the potential for cats to create a nuisance.
	This is an incentive scheme that encourages early registration, desexing of cats, a cat trapping program, material about responsible cat ownership and promotion of responsible cat ownership via media campaigns.
	In 2024 the Council will review and consider whether a cat restriction is appropriate for Glen Eira.
Lisa Reynolds	Question 2
Carnegie	Item 8.16 - With the new lease agreement what steps is the council undertaking to ensure that the monopole and equipment Amplitel Pty Ltd and Vodafone, for their occupation of council premises located at Princess Park, 41 Sussex Road, Caulfield South, pose no health risks to the residents in the area or users of the park?
	ANSWER
	The Australian Government regulates Electromagnetic Energy emissions associated with telecommunications equipment, to protect the health and safety of all members of the public. The Australian Radiation Protection and Nuclear Safety Agency (ARPANSA) sets this standard.
	Council requires the telecommunication providers to adhere to and comply with all laws and any requirements of any authority in connection with their occupation of the pole and equipment room at Princes Park.
Lisa Reynolds	Question 3
Carnegie	Item 8.6 - In consideration of reducing the speed limit on Koornang Rd Carnegie shopping strip from 40 to 30km/h can you please advise the

	statistics for pedestrians being hit by cars in that zone historically?
	ANSWER
	Council's adopted Structure Plan for Carnegie includes an action as part of its implementation plan to limit traffic speed to 30km/hr. in Koornang Road between Dandenong Road and Neerim Road. The timing for this implementation is 5-10 years.
	Crash statistic data is available through VicRoads and shows that in the last 5 years there have been 13 reported casualty crashes involving pedestrians along Koornang Road between Dandenong Road and Neerim Road.
Deborah Wildash	Question 4
Murrumbeena	This question is in reference to Item 8.3.
	In the conclusion, it is recommending that the submissions be referred to an independent planning panel. Please explain who is in this panel, are they a state government body, how are they paid for their services, etc?
	ANSWER
	A panel is appointed by the Minister for Planning to hear submissions about amendments to planning schemes and to make recommendations or provide advice about if the amendment should proceed.
	The panel will consist of one or more members who will have technical or legal expertise, based on the nature of the issues raised in the submissions. This could include in the disciplines of planning, heritage, or traffic engineering.
	The fees to consider submissions in relation to the Carnegie Structure Plan amendment are paid by Council. There is a statutory fee that is set by the State Government. Submitters do not pay a fee to be heard by the panel.
	More information about the planning panel process is available at www.planningpanels.vic.gov.au
Deborah Wildash	Question 5
Murrumbeena	This question is in reference to Item 8.3 - p116. Please explain what is meant by a 'sharing economy'?
	ANSWER
	The term sharing economy is defined in Council's <i>Climate Emergency Response Strategy 2021-2025</i> as 'a peer-to-peer based mechanism for acquiring, providing, or sharing access to goods and services.

	Examples include toy libraries, online buy-swap-sell platforms and community gardens.'
Ashlea Diamond	Question 6
McKinnon	Given the short notice of the closure of the Murrumbeena, Caulfield and Carnegie Early Learning centres and the proximity to the next Council elections, it is fair to assume there is a hidden agenda. Can each Councillor please disclose any conflict of interest regarding any family member or business associates that are involved in property development who would profit from the closures of these centres and redevelopment of these sites.
	ANSWER:
	It's not fair to assume that there is a hidden agenda. As Council has only made a preliminary decision about closing the Early Learning Centre's, no decision has been made regarding what might occur with any surplus facilities. Should the decision to close proceed, Council will then turn its mind to best future use of the facilities in line with our Property Strategy.
Katrina Beer	Question 7
Murrumbeena	Following this 'consultation phase' and all the information that has now come to light, do Councilor's see the importance of the ELC services that local government provides and offers to its local community?
	ANSWER:
	Yes - there has been strong feedback from families about how much they value Council's Early Learning Centre's.
Katrina Beer	Question 8
Murrumbeena	Why isn't Council celebrating the success of its three ELCs? Aren't they something to be proud of? Glen Eira City Council is a leader in offering exceptional quality education and care to children and also employs and pays women at a higher rate than private centres. The Council allows women to return to work with confidence and peace of mind. This is all cause for a big celebration! Don't you agree?
	ANSWER:
	Thanks for your comments. They are consistent with feedback received through the consultation process and will be taken into consideration by Council as part of its decision making.

Ryan Beer	Question 9
Murrumbeena	Is Council aware that this year the State government significantly increased the Building Blocks grant available to Council's for construction of a Community Hub? The discussion paper states there is \$4.5m available however there is now \$9m available to Council's. Additionally, Council's are eligible to apply for Federal Government Infrastructure Grants for construction of Early Learning facilities. In light of this updated information, can the Council reconsider its decision to close the centres on 21 December 2023?
	ANSWER:
	In <u>Your Questions Answered – 17 November</u> , further explanation was provided about why \$4.5M is the maximum amount of funding Council is likely to be eligible for, for a child and family hub on the Murrumbeena Early Learning Centre site. \$9M grant funding relies on 4 x 33 place kindergarten rooms being created which would not fit on the site.
	If Council decides to pursue Option 3 – to consolidate its childcare places into a child and family hub – all available funding opportunities will be pursued.
Ryan Beer	Question 10
Murrumbeena	Council has stated that it will not provide the profit and loss statements and breakdown of costs of running its three ELCs because it is commercially sensitive information. How can the community be assured that the Council is being honest, transparent and financially responsible when it cannot even provide the most basic information, yet it makes sweeping assertions about the losses the ELCs are making which were later revealed through public questioning to have included a 'notional rent'? Council's figures and statements are not adding up and there is a lot of doubt about how Councillors can make a proper vote if this information is not provided.
	ANSWER:
	Commercially sensitive information is kept confidential and not distributed publicly, but it is made available to Councillors. As part of the service review, Councillors were provided with the financial performance of each centre including income, expenditure, utilisation rates, deficits, and expected future deficits.
	Councillors will be in a position to make an informed decision on 12 December.
Clara Yip	Question 11
Carnegie	Councils are required to comply with Child Safe Standards. When questioned on how children were consulted about the preliminary decision to close Glen Eira ELCs, the response was "that process has

	centred on families, including children, who use the Early Learning Centres.". There was no information on how children could be involved in the process. The consultation methods employed (online survey) were focused on gathering feedback from adults who spoke and read English. Can Council elaborate how children were actually (and genuinely) consulted through the consultation period on the decision to close the ELCs as individual members of the community? Children have not had the opportunity to provide feedback in an age- appropriate way.
	ANSWER:
	Council did not directly engage with young children about its preliminary decision. However, feedback that has been submitted on behalf of children through the consultation process has been included in the feedback to be considered by Council before a final decision is made.
Clara Yip	Question 12
Carnegie	From 2026 vulnerable and First Nations children will be able to access 30 hours of pre-prep (transitioning from 4 year old kindergarten), with all children able to access this from 2032. This does not seem to have been mentioned in the Childcare Discussion Paper or factored in with projections. The increase in hours for funded kindergarten/pre-prep will effectively halve the number of kindergarten places both within stand alone kindergartens and funded programs in LDCs. With many working families needing to access funded kindergarten in a long day care setting (to be able to work a full day), has this change been factored in this decision to close Council run ELCs?
	ANSWER:
	The Glen Eira Kindergarten Infrastructure Services Plan has not been updated with estimated demand and supply projections that include the transition of 4-year-old kindergarten to Pre-Prep. Therefore, this data was not incorporated into the Childcare Strategic Services Review.
	Council is in the early stages of working with the Victorian Department of Education to update the Kindergarten Infrastructure and Services Plan for Glen Eira.
Dora Banyasz	Question 13
Ormond	Council has still not confirmed if it has considered that 4-year-old kindergarten students need to be in a full-year of kindergarten for their final year before transitioning to prep/primary school. Have Councillors taken this into consideration in their decision making in relation to the future of the ELCs?

[
	ANSWER: Council's preliminary decision to consider closing the Early Learning Centres in December 2023 was in recognition of the natural end point of the calendar year, including for kindergarten children. However, feedback about the challenges associated with the short timeframe between Council's final decision on 12 December and potential closure on 21 December is currently being considered by Councillors prior to the final decision being made.
Dora Banyasz	Question 14
Ormond	Members of the Glen Eira community have spoken with representatives of small ELCs. We have information which shows that these smaller-run centres are running at a profit in the same price bracket as Glen Eira's fees. We have been dismissed by Council officers and the CEO telling us we are comparing apples and oranges. Whilst we are not suggesting all centres are the same as Glen Eira's ELCs, we have information which shows smaller-run centres are profitable. Why is Glen Eira Council not providing us with transparent information about its financials and why is it still insisting on charging notional rent? Why isn't Glen Eira investigating other smaller-run centres which are successful and trying to make its own ELCs financially sustainable so that they can continue to provide high quality learning and care to our children and support the community?
	ANSWER:
	Questions about the need for Council to comply with the National Competition Policy which includes accounting for notional rent have previously been answered in <u>Your Questions Answered 20 October</u> ; <u>Your Questions Answered – 17 November</u> and the <u>Childcare Viability</u> <u>Explained</u> publication.
	In Your Questions Answered – <u>17 November</u> it was explained that profit and loss statements and full cost breakdowns is commercially sensitive information, and is therefore commercial in confidence because Council's childcare services operate in a competitive marketplace.
	The work that Council has undertaken to investigate the financial sustainability of its Early Learning Centres is described in <u>Your</u> <u>Questions Answered – Family Briefing – 5 October, Your Questions</u> <u>Answered – 17 November and the Childcare Viability Explained</u> <u>publication.</u>
Kate Vrljic	Question 15
Carnegie	The budget outlined in the ELC paper is narrow - it doesn't take into consideration the broader context of Council's budget position and the choices it's making. For example, in Council's Capital Works Program 2023-24 it states that an additional \$442,000 of Council's cash is being spent on the Town Hall Refurbishment (I can see in the description so please do not repeat the information from that). The

	Town Hall appears to be in good working condition. Can't Council redirect these funds to invest in the ELCs which actually get used by more people and provide high quality early learning, education and care to children? ANSWER: Each year, Council makes decisions about where to allocate funding, striking the right balance between ambition for new initiatives, maintaining quality service delivery and remaining financially sustainable. The 2023–24 Budget is no different. The funding of Capital Works projects is based on rigorous prioritisation and an annual process of community consultation. Demand for capital investment is always greater than the funding available and there is a long pipeline of worthy projects
	waiting for available funding.
Kate Vrljic	Question 16
Carnegie	In Council's Community Engagement Policy dated 23 February 2023, you state "where projects impact children and young people we work with our local early years and youth service providers and school communities and use age-appropriate methods." Can you please provide me with names of the local early years and youth service providers and school communities you worked with to reach your preliminary decision to close the three ELCs? Furthermore, please tell me what age-appropriate methods you have used to engage our children regarding your preliminary decision to close the three ELCs?
	ANSWER:
	The requirement for Council to make a preliminary decision before consulting has previously been answered in <u>Your Questions</u> <u>Answered – Family Briefing – 5 October</u> , <u>Your Questions Answered</u> <u>20 October</u> , and <u>Your Questions Answered – 17 November</u>
	Council did not directly engage with young children about its preliminary decision. However, feedback that has been submitted on behalf of children has been included in the feedback that is being considered by Council before a final decision is made.
Anna Clarke	Question 17
Murrumbeena	Do Councillors understand that there is a general consensus in the community that Glen Eira Council is using our women and children as political chess pieces? Any decision to close the centres either in December 2023 or in 6 months-time appears to be strategically timed to be before the October 2024 election so that Council can get these ELCs off its books. This decision and process that Council has adopted does appear to be conducted in line with the Local Government Act's requirements regarding transparency principles,

	engaging the municipal community in strategic planning and strategic decision making or collaborating to achieve the best outcomes for the municipal community, including future generations.
	We are satisfied that our process has complied with the requirements of the Local Government Act. Questions about this have previously been answered in <u>Your Questions Answered – Family Briefing – 5</u> <u>October</u> and <u>Your Questions Answered – 17 November</u>
Anna Clarke	Question 18
Murrumbeena	Why would Glen Eira City Council pay for the The Civic Partnership 'Glen Eira City Council Communication Plan' dated 15 September 2023, prior to Councillors making a decision? It appears Councillors may have not been able to keep an open mind in accordance with Winky Pop Pty Ltd v Hobsons Bay City Council if they saw this report prior to making a vote that detailed the Council's communication plan of a preliminary decision that had not yet been made.
	ANSWER:
	Council takes seriously its responsibility to transparently communicate its decisions and consult with the community around preliminary decisions, prior to final decisions being made. As part of this, Council engaged expert consultants The Civic Partnership to develop a communications and engagement approach, with the objective of ensuring the community could be quickly and fully informed if a preliminary decision was made. This is consistent with good governance.
Andrew Bolger	Question 19
Murrumbeena	
	In Council's Community Engagement Policy dated 23 February 2021, you promised that you will use different types of engagement to ensure you hear from different groups in our community such as children or groups at risk of not being represented. At the public meeting on Wednesday 8 November 2023 you didn't even answer Ari Hunt-Koadlow's public question and to date you haven't provided any mechanism to engage children. Given this decision impacts children, how will you be engaging them to inform your final decision on 12 December 2023?
	ANSWER:
	Council did not directly engage with young children about its preliminary decision. However, feedback that has been submitted on behalf of children has been included in the feedback that is being considered by Council before a final decision is made.

Andrew Bolger	Question 20
Murrumbeena	How do Councillors feel about 4 female staff members being photographed and on display on the front cover of its Gender Equality Action Plan 2022-2025? Can't the Council see the irony of dismissing these women from a good and well paying workplace, and yet when it was to the Council's advantage, it placed these hard working women on the front cover of its material to promote Gender Equality and the Council's good work in this space?
	ANSWER:
	Thank you for your observation. We will take this as a comment.
Robert Breda	Question 21
Murrumbeena	The information provided in the Background section on the council's Child Future Survey states; "Operating at 78 per cent capacity in 2022-23, the numbers at our centres keep going down while costs keep going up." However in the Discussion Paper on page 23, the table Council's Early Learning Centres % Utilisation, shows a clear trend in increase year on year over the past 3 financial years following the drop from 2 years of Covid and Lockdown law impacts. This misrepresentation of facts in the council's message immediately prior to taking the survey has considerable impact on the wider community and their feedback who have not been provided with an accurate account of the facts. How will the council correct this misleading message to the community in retrospect and also take this mistake into account when collating and reviewing all responses to the council survey?
	ANSWER:
	The utilisation graph on page 23 of the Childcare Discussion Paper demonstrates a decline in the average yearly utilisation across all three centres from 89% in 2017-2018 to 78% in 2022-2023. Utilisation trends were examined for the two years prior to the COVID pandemic in recognition that the pandemic impacted the services in 2020-2021 and 2021-2022. However, utilisation in 2022-2023 is still lower than pre-pandemic levels.
Robert Breda	Question 22
Murrumbeena	The Our Priorities, Our Future process is not completed, with reports currently being worked on following the completion of the group meetings on 20 November 2023 for reports to be provided to Councillors some time in December, though not data specified in the timeline, and then information coming out to the community in early 2023. How can Councillors make a decision to close a service that is being considered as part of the Our Priorities, Our Future process when that process is not completed? Furthermore, what if it becomes apparent that children and ELC services are important to the

	community and you go ahead and decide to close the centres? It is such a shame that this process has been so rushed because this does not feel like thorough or transparent community engagement or decision making.
	ANSWER:
	Councillors have been regularly briefed throughout the Our Priorities, Our Future community engagement program, including early results in November, prior to final survey outcomes being provided to Council in December. Councillors will be briefed on final Our Priorities, Our Future survey outcomes prior to making a final decision on the future of Council's early learning centres on 12 December.
	1,746 Glen Eira residents responded to the survey. This is 1.15 per cent of Glen Eira's total population. The outcomes showed 'youth and family services and early education' was ranked ninth of 17 service areas in response to a question asking the community which services they feel are most important. Of all responses, 21 per cent of respondents – or more than one in five – included 'youth and family services and early education' in their five highest priority services.
	123 incomplete paper surveys were submitted at our targeted engagements with harder-to-reach cohorts, such as young people aged 17 and under, seniors, people with disability and culturally and linguistically diverse people. Of these, 'youth and family services and early education' was prioritised lower than the broader community survey, at 13 th of 17 service areas. 19 per cent of these respondents – or less than one in five – included 'youth and family services and early education' in their five highest priority services.
Megan Lyall	Question 23
Bentleigh East	I am locked into rosters for 2024 and I am scared I will lose my job if the ELCs close on 21 December 2023 because I cannot find alternative care for my children. What can I do?
	ANSWERS:
	Our Family Liaison Officers have up to date information about vacancies in other centres in Glen Eira and are available to support individual families find an alternative Centre.
Megan Lyall	Question 24
Bentleigh East	Regarding the ELCs, why have we heard a number of accounts from people in the Caulfield centre parent network of prospective families for 2024 who put in for placements for 2024 at some point earlier on in this process, but were told that the centres are closing and thus they won't be receiving any placement offers?
	One particular parents accepted an offer at Caulfield ELCs, filled out all the paperwork, then couldn't get in touch for weeks and then told they are no longer accepting applications to the centre and that the

 ELC was closing at the end of the year. This happened in October 2023 and we have written evidence. So this means that many families may have simply been told no for next year and have found other places elsewhere. With the prospective placements going out for 2024, has Council engaged with this family and all others that have enquired but were told this? ANSWERS: Prospective families enquiring about enrolling now, and on our waiting list for 2024 have been transparently advised of Council's preliminary decision to close the Early Learning Centres. Individual families have made decisions to not accept an available place at our centres after being informed of Council's preliminary decision.
Question 25
How much did Council pay for The Civic Partnership 'Glen Eira City Council Communication Plan' dated 15 September 2023?
ANSWER
To ensure that the community was transparently, quickly and fully informed and engaged after a preliminary decision was made, we engaged expert consultants. They were engaged to provide advice and develop communications and engagement approaches in line with our <i>Community Engagement Policy</i> , <i>Community Engagement</i> <i>Strategy</i> , and <i>Local Government Act</i> . The communications plan was extensive and considered the needs of a range of the broad community, people directly impacted, and Council's many other stakeholders. The cost of developing such a comprehensive and considered communications plan was in the order of \$15,000.
Question 26
Can Glen Eira Council please explain why they chose to spend money on a communications plan rather than invest this money into the ELCs, given the Council says finances are a key reason for closure?
ANSWER
Council takes seriously its legislative obligations to transparency communicate and engage with the community following a preliminary decision on the future of a service it provides, so we needed to develop a comprehensive and considered communications plan and sought expert guidance. As we have said previously, significant operating losses of more than \$570,000 per year are just one of many concerns Council took into consideration when making its preliminary decision.

Jeremy Koadlow	Question 27
Caulfield	By way of anecdotal evidence, have councillors been seeking feedback from within their own immediate networks about the closures of the ELC's. If yes, what has been the feedback to date? If no, why?
	ANSWER
	Councillors are in the process of reviewing feedback and submissions in order to inform their view before the final decision is made on 12 December. It is important that Councillors consider all feedback, not just that of their immediate networks.
Katerina Patras	Question 28
Flack Murrumbeena	Councillors appear to think that the community do not want a hub (which could be achieved via Building Blocks / government funding). The problem here is that the community cannot know what a hub or other options look like, because Council has not informed the community via proper consultation. When it comes to exploring other options, Glen Eira Council cannot purport to know what the community wants (or doesn't want) unless proper consultation is done. It appears Council is wedging the community towards one idea because of its desire to remove ELC services. If Glen Eira pursues the hub option it can still provide continuity of high-quality education and care, retain its excellent staff, outdoor natural green spaces for children, engage women in the workforce, eliminate gender discrimination and champion gender equality. Why has Council not consulted with the community on alternative options such as a hub?
	ANSWER
	Council is considering all feedback received during the recent consultation period, including feedback received about the third option outlined in the Childcare Discussion Paper which investigated the possibility of Council consolidating its childcare places into a child and family hub.
Katerina Patras	Question 29
Flack Murrumbeena	My four-year old child's mental health and wellbeing is being compromised with Glen Eira's preliminary decision. She knows her kindergarten and baby sister's early learning centre may close and she keeps asking me and my husband where she will go to kindergarten next year, as she has one year left. Is Council aware of the impact this process is having on children and that waiting until 12 December 2023 for a final decision is impacting our children's mental wellbeing? Furthermore, providing a 6-month extension will have the same negative impact on our preschoolers' mental health, stability and wellbeing as they will be uprooted a mere 6 months before starting prep. This does not appear well thought out by Council. Please think of the children.

	ANSWER
	Thank you. We will take this as a comment.

It is recorded that Cr Pennicuik vacated the Chamber at 10:27pm. It is recorded that Cr Pennicuik entered the Chamber at 10:32pm.

It is recorded that Cr Athanasopoulos vacated the Chamber at 10:40pm. It is recorded that Cr Athanasopoulos entered the Chamber at 10:42pm.

It is recorded that Cr Zmood vacated the Chamber at 10:47pm. It is recorded that Cr Zmood entered the Chamber at 10:51pm.

11. CONFIDENTIAL ITEMS

Nil

12. CLOSURE OF MEETING

The meeting closed at 10.59pm.

Confirmed this 19 December 2023.

Chairperson.....